

A כרמלית

כרמלית –

OVERVIEW

The names used for three of the רשויות לשבת are self explanatory. The name כרמלית however needs some clarification, why do we call it with this name. תוספות offers the interpretation given in the תלמוד ירושלמי.

בירושלמי בריש שבת¹ תני רבי חייא כרמל רך ומלא² לא לח ולא יבש אלא בינוני -

In the beginning of מסכת שבת it is mentioned that רבי חייא taught that the word 'כרמלית' stems from the word כרמל, which refers to ripening grain, for the word כרמל is comprised of two (opposite) terms: רך³, meaning soft and not yet mature, and מלא, meaning full and ripe. Together they convey the meaning of 'כרמל' that the grain is **neither moist nor dry, but somewhere in between -**

הכא נמי כרמלית אינו לא כרשות היחיד ולא כרשות הרבים:

Similarly here too by the רשות of a כרמלית it is **neither like a רה"י nor like a רה"ר, but somewhere in between.⁴**

SUMMARY

A כרמלית is not like a רה"י, because; a) you may not carry in it more than אמות (ד, אמות), b) you may not carry from a כרמלית to a רה"י, and c) if you transfer an object from a כרמלית to a רה"ר it is אסור only מדרבנן.

A כרמלית is not like a רה"ר, because; a) you may not carry from a כרמלית to a רה"ר even פחות מד' אמות, and b) if you transfer an object from a כרמלית to a רה"י it is אסור only מדרבנן.

THINKING IT OVER

What other explanations are there why it is called a כרמלית?

¹ Towards the end of הלכה א (on דף ה,ב in our תלמוד ירושלמי texts).

² The 'ומלא' is 'ומל' is 'מסורת הש"ס' גורס: 'ומלא', not 'ומל'.

³ The inverse of 'רך' is 'קשה'.

⁴ Perhaps by expressing the idea of a כרמלית in the negative "neither moist nor dry", and "לא כרה"י ולא כרה"ר" we are given to understand that a כרמלית is not a "real" רשות. It is (a) "neither", only a מדרבנן רשות.