

דילמא דאית ביה כדי לארוג מפה לזה כולי –

Perhaps it has enough in order to weave a cloth for this one, etc.

Overview

אשי attempted to prove that כולן 'א' שיעור from a ברייתא which stated that if two people carried out weaver's reed¹ they are חייב. The גמרא asked perhaps there is sufficient thread on this קנה to weave two separate cloths.² תוספות explains how this answers the previous question of דעלמא קנה לישמענין.

תוספות responds to an anticipated difficulty:

והא דלא נקט קנה דעלמא³ -

And the reason that the ברייתא does not mention an ordinary reed, but rather specifically a קנה דגרדי -

לאשמעינן דאף על גב דאין רגילות לארוג שתי מפות בקנה אחד⁴ -

To inform us that even though it is not usual to weave two cloths with one reed, usually a separate קנה דגרדי is used for each weaving of a cloth, nevertheless -

אם יש שיעור לארוג מפה לזה ולזה⁵ חייב:

If in this קנה דגרדי there is a שיעור to weave two cloths he is חייב.

Summary

The שיעור for carrying can be valued by its potential even if it is not practical.

Thinking it over

Is there a dispute between רש"י (בד"ה קנה דעלמא) and תוספות in the understanding of the question, 'א"כ לישמענין קנה דעלמא'⁶

¹ The weaver's reed (קנה של גרדי) refers to a piece of wood upon which the horizontal threads (חוטי הערב) are wound. The vertical threads are separated alternately and this קנה גרדי is thrown between them to weave the garment.

² To be חייב for הוצאה one needs to carry out something which is useful. A קנה דגרדי is usually useful for one garment; however since here it is has sufficient thread for two garments it is useful for two people; it has two שיעורים.

³ Previously the גמרא asked that perhaps this קנה דגרדי has enough wood/fuel to cook two eggs so there is a שיעור לכל 'א. The גמרא answered, if he is חייב because there is enough wood/fuel, so why mention דגרדי, any קנה would be חייב. The same question seems to be here, if there is enough thread to make two cloths, so what is special about קנה דגרדי; the ברייתא is only telling us that if there are two שיעורים, both are חייב. We could know this rule from any קנה.

⁴ We may have thought that since one קנה דגרדי is used for only one waving, it should be considered 'שיעור א', regardless of how much thread there is on it, since it will be used for only one weaving.

⁵ It is considered as if it is two שיעורים.

⁶ See חי' רע"א ד"ה א"כ.