

אלא אם כן ממונה עליה כרבי חנניא בן תרדיון –

Unless someone like רבי חנניא בן תרדיון is appointed over it

OVERVIEW

ארנקי של צדקה to an פרוטה said that a person should not give a פרוטה to an ארנקי של צדקה, unless someone like רחב"ת is appointed over it. תוספות explains what is meant by someone like רחב"ת.

פירוש נאמן כמותו אבל צדיק כמותו לא –

It means that the ממונה should be as trustworthy as רחב"ת, but it does not (necessarily) mean that the ממונה should be as righteous as רחב"ת –

דהא גבאים דבימי אמוראים¹ לא היו צדיקים כמותו² –

For the צדיקים as רחב"ת were not as great צדיקים as רחב"ת in the times of the גבאי צדקה was.

³ תוספות responds to an anticipated difficulty:

ולחכי נקט רבי חנניא בן תרדיון משום מעשה שבא לידו –

And the reason רחב"ת is because of the episode which mentioned רב"י And the reason רחב"ת is because of the episode which happened with רחב"ת –

דאמר פרק קמא דמסכת עבודה זרה (דף יז, ב) –

As the רחב"ת stated - מסכת ע"ז of פרק first relates in the גמרא As the רחב"ת stated -

מעות פורים נתחלפו לי במעות של צדקה וחלקתים לעניים⁴ –

Monies designated for פורים became exchanged by me with צדקה money, and I disbursed all the exchanged money to the poor.

תוספות offers a similar example (where a name is mentioned for a specific incident).

וכן⁵ בפרק במה טומנין (שבת דף מט, א ושם) דאמר תפילין צריכין גוף נקי כאלישע –

And similarly in טומנין the גמרא states that 'donning תפילין requires a

¹ לארנקי here concludes that nowadays (in the times of the גמרא) one should give ארנקי; however, תנא was a רב"י. ממני עלה כרחב"ת if (only) של צדקה.

² (see ע"ז there) מקהיל קהילות ברבים because he was ס"ת by the Romans together with עקה"ש רחב"ת was burnt.

³ If the גבאים do not have to be at the level of רחב"ת in צדקות just in נאמנות, why mention רחב"ת altogether, there certainly were other people (in the times of the רב"י) who were an example of the required נאמנות.

⁴ there explains that he collected monies for לעניים (and it cannot be used for anything else); however רחב"ת confused these monies and he thought it was regular צדקה money, so he distributed it to the poor (not for פורים). רחב"ת then repaid the פורים money from his own pocket (and not from the קופת צדקה). See ע"ז there for an additional interpretation as well as תוספות there מעות ד"ה who asks on פרש"י and offers a different interpretation, עיי"ש.

⁵ See 'Thinking it over' # 1.

clean body like אלישע; there too -

לא צדיק כאלישע קאמר אלא גוף נקי שידע לזהר שלא ישן בהם ושלא יפיח בהם קאמר –
The תפילין did **not mean that** one has to be a צדיק like אלישע in order to don תפילין, **but rather** the גמרא meant that the person should know how to be careful while wearing תפילין, **that he should not sleep or pass gas while wearing them** -

ולא נקט אלישע אלא משום דאיתרחיש ביה ניסא⁶:

And the גמרא **only mentioned אלישע** because a miracle occurred to אלישע with תפילין.

SUMMARY

The גמרא mentions רחב"ת (not because of his צדקות [which is not required], but rather) because he was exemplary in his נאמנות as the גמרא relates elsewhere.

THINKING IT OVER

1. Seemingly the comparison (of רחב"ת and נאמנות) to אלישע and גוף נקי is not appropriate;⁷ for there the גמרא clearly states that a גוף נקי כאלישע is required (but not that he be a צדיק כאלישע); however here the גמרא only states כרחב"ת but it does not say נאמן כרחב"ת. How does תוספות compare the two?!

2. Regarding רחב"ת there is a story which proves his נאמנות, therefore it is understood why רחב"ת mentions רחב"י (for נאמנות is the issue at hand); however why mention אלישע regarding גוף נקי when the story תוספות alludes too,⁸ is not regarding a גוף נקי?⁹

⁶ The גמרא there relates that the מלכות רומי הרשעה decreed that whoever puts on תפילין will have his brain pierced. However, אלישע ignored the decree and went in the marketplace with תפילין. A Roman officer saw him and chased after him. When he reached him, אלישע had already taken off the תפילין and was holding it in his hands. In response to the officer's question, אלישע said he is holding dove wings and indeed when אלישע opened his hands, there were the dove wings. From that incident onwards he was called בעל כנפים. See 'Thinking it over' # 2.

⁷ See footnote # 5.

⁸ See footnote # 6.

⁹ See תוספות שבת מט, א ד"ה כאלישע.