

לא יפתח אדם חנות של נחתומין - A person should not open up a bakery

Overview

The גמרא cited a משנה which states that one should not open up a bakery under a storehouse. There is a dispute between רש"י and תוספות as to the reason for this prohibition.

פירוש הקונטרס¹ משום שהעשן קשה לאוצר -

רש"י explained because the smoke from the bakery ruins whatever foodstuffs are in the storehouse –

פרש"י disagrees with תוספות:

וקשה לרבינו תם דלקמן² אמר ביין התיירו שמשביחו -

And the ר"ת has a difficulty with פרש"י for later the משנה stated if the אוצר contained only wine, they permitted to open a bakery underneath it, since the bakery improves the wine -

ועשן ודאי מזיק ליין דהא יין מעושן פסול לנסכים³ -

However smoke certainly ruins the wine, for smoked wine is unfit for נסכים on the מזבח, since it is of an inferior quality –

תוספות offers his interpretation:

אלא נראה לרבינו תם דהיזק עשן ליכא כיון דאיכא שם תקרה ומעזיבה לא יכנס שם העשן -

Rather the view of the ר"ת is that there is no smoke damage since there is a ceiling and plastering above the bakery, the smoke will not enter the storehouse above the bakery -

אלא טעמא שההבל מזיק את האוצר אבל את היין משביח -

However the reason why not to open a bakery underneath a storehouse is because the heat of the baking harms the אוצר, but heat improves the wine –

תוספות deals with an anticipated difficulty:

וגרסינן לקמן⁴ אמר רב יוסף והאי דידן אפילו שרגא קשיא ליה כלומר הבלא דשרגא -

And the text there should read; “ר"י said but our wine, even a candle ruins it”;

¹ בד"ה חנות.

² משנה in the (first) כ,ב.

³ See משנה in פו,ב (see there מעושן פרש"י). How can רש"י state that the reason why we cannot open a bakery is on account of the smoke; if that is the case why would we be permitted to open the bakery underneath the אוצר of wine, since the smoke will ruin the wine; not make it any better as the משנה states.

⁴ כ,ב. In our text it reads דשרגא קוטר (even the smoke of a candle).

he meant the heat⁵ of the candle -

ולא גרסינן קוטרא דשרגא:

And the text does not read; 'the smoke of a candle'; for smoke always⁷ damaged wine.

Summary

The problem with a bakery under a storehouse is the smoke, according to רש"י; and the heat according to תוספות. Smoked wine is פסול לנסכים.

Thinking it over

How can we explain why רש"י (בד"ה חנות) mentions יין, since the next משנה states ביין⁸!!⁸

⁵ ר"י was commenting that in the days bygone (in the time of the משנה, where it states משביחו) heat improved the wine, but nowadays even the heat of one candle spoils the wine. This is in accordance with תוספות explanation that we are dealing with heat, but not with smoke.

⁶ See footnote # 4. Our גירסא there seems to support רש"י that the issue is smoke.

⁷ See footnote # 3. מעושן was even פסול לנסכים in the משנה and before.

⁸ See רש"י and דוד אות ג.