

And how much; Rav Yeyvoh said, etc.

וכמה אמר רב ייבא כולי –

OVERVIEW

The גמרא established the ברייתא, which required distancing a wall from (a wall with) windows, in a case where the wall was perpendicular to the window wall. The גמרא asked how far must the distance be, and רב ייבא answered, the width of the window. Shortly the גמרא asked again, how can we say that we need to distance the width of the window, but the משנה states that we need to distance ד' אמות from the window. (ד' אמות תנן and, וכמה) assumed that these two questions were asked by the same מקשן, which leads to תוספות question.

תוספות asks:

ותימה דהשתא בעי וכמה ובתר הכי פריך והתנן ארבע אמות¹ -

And it is astounding! For now the מקשן asks, and how much must he distance the wall from the windows, and later the מקשן asks, but we learnt that he must distance ד' אמות (so how can ר' ייבא say ר' ייבא)?!

תוספות answers:

ויש לומר דרב ייבא גופיה בעי וכמה ולא גמרא² -

And one can say that רב ייבא himself asked 'וכמה' and answered, but it was not the מקשן of the גמרא who asked 'וכמה' -

וכענין זה יש באלו מציאות³ (בבא מציעא דף כא,א ושם דיבור המתחיל וכמה):

And something similar to this is found in פירק אלו מציאות.

SUMMARY

Sometimes the one who answers is the one who asked.

THINKING IT OVER

Why would ר' ייבא assume that the ברייתא is independent of the משנה⁴ And is it?

¹ Since the מקשן knew that the distance is ד' אמות (as he asks later), why did he ask now וכמה?!

² ר' ייבא asked 'וכמה', for he assumed that this ברייתא of יאפיל is independent of our משנה, so he did not assume that the distance of the משנה applies to the ברייתא. The מקשן later, who asked ד' אמות תנן, was a new מקשן (not ר' ייבא) and he understood that the ברייתא is merely an elaboration of the משנה (not an independent ברייתא, therefore he asked on ר' ייבא. Therefore there is no question since there are two different מקשים. See 'Thinking it over'.

³ The גמרא there asks on the משנה regarding פירות מפוזרות that one may keep, 'וכמה', and יצחק answers ד' אמות ר' יצחק. See the תוספות there that it is evident from the continuation of the גמרא that ר' יצחק was the one who asked 'וכמה' and he gave the answer, עיי"ש.

⁴ See footnote # 2.