

On the mouth of a jug

אפומא דהצבא -

Overview

The גמרא asked, how much must the אפדנא of פאפי shake in order to have the seed pressers distance themselves. The גמרא answers that if it shakes the lid on the top of a jug. ר"י explains this to mean that if one places the jug on top of the wall (of the אפדנא), the lid of the jug will shake because of the vibrations from the pressers.

תוספות asks:

על פירוש הקונטרס קשיא לרבינו יצחק דאיך יהא האפדנא נייד כולי האי -

The ר"י has a difficulty with פ"ר for how can the אפדנא shake so much -

עד שתתנדנד הנכתמא דאם כן הבית קרוב ליפול -

To the extent that the lid (of the jug) will shake, for if indeed this is so, the house is about to collapse, meaning that it is not well constructed -

ולפי הענין משמע שהיה בנין חזק שהרי מתוך העושר בנאה -

However according to the context of the story, it seems that it was a strong building, for he built it on account of his richness, he would not have scrimped on the quality of the construction -

תוספות provides additional proof that אפדנא is a well-constructed edifice:

ובמסכת שבת (דף עז,ב) נמי אמר¹ מאי אפנדא אפיתחא דין² שמאספין שם לדין -

And in שבת the גמרא also states, 'what is אפדנא; there is judgment at its opening', meaning that they gather there for judgment (a court or בית דין) -

משמע דבירה גדולה היא -

Indicating that it is a large building, so how can the walls move so much that the lid of a jug will shake?!

תוספות offers his interpretation:

ונראה לרבינו יצחק דכד נידא נכתמא כשאדם אווז הכד בידיו³ שזוהו דבר מועט הרבה -

And it appears to the ר"י that when the גמרא states, 'as the lid shakes', it means that it shakes when the person is holding the jug in his hand, for this is a very minor vibration, so -

¹ In our גמרות it merely states אפדנא אפיתחא דין (without the מאי). The גמרא there explains why things are named the way they are.

² The word אפדנא is comprised of two parts; the אפ refers to פתח and the דנא refers to דין.

³ According to the ר"י it will take very strong vibrations to make the lid shake if it is on top of the wall, however even a minor vibration will make the lid shake when it is held in a person's hand.

אם כך מתנדנד האפדנא חייב להרחיק -

So if the אפדנא shakes that much (to casue the lid to shake in one's hand), he is obligated to distance himself.

פרש"י offers a validation of תוספות:

ולרבינו יצחק בן אברהם נראה שאין פירוש הקונטרס דחוק –

And the א"ר maintains that פרש"י is not at all difficult -

דבדבר מועט מתנדנד הנכתמא שהוא דבר קל אף על פי שהאפדנא אינו מתנדנד⁴ כל כך:

For with a very minor vibration the lid on top of the אפדנא wall will shake, since the lid is very light, even though the אפדנא will not shake so much.

Summary

אפדנא (and the ר"א) explain that the lid will shake when it is on top of the אפדנא wall; while the ר"ת maintains that it will shake while holding it in your hand

Thinking it over

When will it be more likely that the lid will shake from the banging of the pressers, if the jug is on the wall or if the jug is in his hand?

⁴ When the vibration reach the אפדנא wall, it will not cause it to shake (since it is a strong building), however once these vibration reach the lid (which is very light) it will shake considerably. [Place two coins next to each other touching and pin one coin down with your finger, strike the pinned down coin with a third coin; the pinned down coin will remain stationary while the coin next to it will be pushed away, from the vibration (try it, you'll like it)]