## נשאת לא תצא – And if she married she need not leave.

The עדים states that if there were two עדים who testified that the husband died (or divorced his wife) and two other עדים contradict them and claim that he did not die, the ruling is that if the wife remarried she is not required to leave her new husband.

The גמרא in מסכת כתובות asks a question on the ברייתא:

How may this new couple remain together? It is a case of תרי ותרי; she is a תרי ותרי, she is a ספק אשת איש. It is a איסור מדאורייתא . If they have relations with each other, they are both required to bring an אשם חלוי; for they may have transgressed an גמרא. איסור ערוה will cite the answers offered in the גמרא.

מסכת כתובות of בברק ב' דכתובות ברק ב' דכתובות הגמתחיל כגון). In the second מסכת כתובות of מוקי - the אמרא establishes that this ruling applies in a case –

מעדיה מעדיה - that she remarried to one of the witnesses who testified on her behalf. For this די there is no ספק איסור. He is certain that she is no longer married to her previous husband; he saw him dead. As far as the wife is concerned there is also no ספק איסור for we are discussing a case where –

ברי לי – and she said I am certain that I am no longer married<sup>1</sup>. Since they are both certain that there is no ספק), therefore we allow them to remain married.

There still remains the question of suspicion. Perhaps this עד and this woman are in collusion<sup>2</sup>. They want to marry each other and therefore each claims that the husband died. תוספות answers -

רוחשדא ליכא – and there is no room for suspicion –

מס' כתובות **as I explained there** in מס' כתובות. In a case where two witnesses testify (as is the case here), there is never any concern of collusion. The second עד would never testify falsely so that his fellow עד could achieve his illegitimate goal. אין אדם חוטא. No person sins on behalf of someone else.

## **Summary**

In a case of חרי ותרי the new couple may remain married if she remarried an and claims that she is certain her husband is dead.

## Thinking it over

Why can they not get married לכתחילה?

 $<sup>^{1}</sup>$  כתובות in כתובות explains that her being certain means that she claims that if he would be alive he would have been here by now.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The rule is that an עד אחד is believed to testify that the husband died. However because of the suspicion that he is testifying falsely because he may want to marry her, the עד is forbidden to marry this woman.
<sup>3</sup> דף כב,ב ד"ה כגון.