

ועל אותה שעה שנינו מעשה שבא – And it was concerning that time that we learnt, there was an incident that the עומר came, etc.

Overview

The גמרא stated that the משנה which states that they brought the עומר from צריפין, etc. is referring to this war between the חשמונאים. Our תוספות attempts to reconcile the chronology of events.

(כולה¹) משנה היא במנחות בפרק רבי ישמעאל (דף סד,ב ושם) –

– פרק ר"י in מסכת מנחות in משנה (מעשה שבא וכו') This

תוספות asks:

ואם תאמר והא בימי מרדכי הוה המעשה -

And if you will say; but this incident took place in the days of מרדכי -

כדאמר התם בגמרא² דאתא חרשא אותיב ידיה אגנה³ כולי אמר להן מרדכי -

As the גמרא there relates that a deaf-mute came, put his hand on a (roof) [garden], etc. so מרדכי said to them, etc. This concludes the citation from the גמרא -

ותימה גדולה היא אם חיה מרדכי כל כך⁴ -

And it is a great wonder if מרדכי would have lived so long -

דבית חשמונאי לא היה כי אם ר"ס⁵ שנים קודם החורבן כדאמר בפרק קמא דעבודה זרה (דף ט,א) -

For the house of חשמונאי did not reign until two hundred (sixty) [six] years before the destruction of בית שני, as the גמרא states in the first פרק of ע"ז –

תוספות answers:

ונראה לרבינו יצחק דכל אותן שהיו בקיאים ברמזים ובלשונוות היו נקראים על שם מרדכי -

And it seems to the ר"י that all those people who were well knowledgeable in allusions and languages were called by the name of מרדכי -

¹ Others indicate that this word 'כולה' or כולי should be part of the ד"ה of תוספות, i.e. מעשה שבא כולי.

² The story there is that they did not know from where to bring the עומר (on the second day of פסח). The deaf-mute put one hand atop of a roof – גג, and the other hand on top of a hut – צריף, so מרדכי said is there a place which is called גגות צריפין, etc. They found the place and bought the עומר from there. In any event it was during the lifetime of מרדכי.

³ There in מנחות the גירסא is אגרא which means a roof.

⁴ איש יהודי הנה בשושן הבירה that מגילת אסתר (ב,ה-ו) as it states in חורבן בית ראשון eleven years before מרדכי went to בבל. The story of the two brothers took place sometime after the initial reign of the חשמונאים, so מרדכי even if he was an infant when he came to בבל, would have been more than 300 years old; that is a תימה גדולה.

⁵ The רש"י amends this to read ר"י (instead of ר"ס). See TIE previous footnote # 2.

לפי שהוא היה ראש וחכם להכיר -

Since **מרדכי was the head of the Jewish people and the wise one to recognize** allusions and languages,⁶ so they called the subsequent sages who were familiar with linguistics by the name **מרדכי**. However that **מרדכי** by the חשמונאים was not the **מרדכי** of the מגילה -

ואותו מעשה דג' נשים דמייתי התם⁷ נראה שהיה מרדכי ממש -

However,⁸ that story of the three women , which the גמרא cites there, it appears to **that it was actually מרדכי** who understood what they meant -

דקאמר⁹ והיינו דתנן (שקלים פרק ה' משנה א') פתחיה על הקנין¹⁰:

Since the גמרא **concludes there, 'and this is what the משנה teaches that פתחיה was** in charge of the **קנין**.

Summary

People who were familiar with languages were called **מרדכי**. The **מרדכי** of the עומר was not **מרדכי** of the מגילה, however the **מרדכי** of the נשים ג' was **מרדכי** of the מגילה.

Thinking it over

When תוספות wanted to prove that the **מרדכי** of the נשים ג' is **מרדכי ממש**, why did he just cite the words **פתחיה על הקנין** (which does not seem to prove anything),¹¹ when he should have cited the conclusion of the משנה that **מרדכי זה** פתחיה זה?

⁶ He discovered the plot by בתן ותרש for he knew their language.

⁷ Three women bought birds for קרבנות, but they were obscure as to the nature of these קרבנות (the people assumed that these were קנים that are brought for a יולדת or a זבה where one is a חטאת and the other an עולה). However **מרדכי** clarified that they were all קרבנות נדבה which are an עולה.

⁸ Even though that it is a תימה גדולה to say that the **מרדכי** of the חשמונאים was **מרדכי** of the מגילה, nevertheless the **מרדכי** of the נשים שלש was indeed the **מרדכי** of the מגילה.

⁹ We cite the גמרא there (on סה,א); שפותח דברים ודורשן ויודע בשבועים; (סה,א) on. The fact that the גמרא states **מרדכי זה** פתחיה indicates that we are discussing the well know **מרדכי** of the מגילה.

¹⁰ The קנין refer to the two birds that are required to be brought by a יולדת or a זבה, where one is an עולה and the other a חטאת. The laws can be somewhat complicated and so the one in charge was **מרדכי זה** פתחיה – See 'Thinking it over'.

¹¹ See footnote # 9.