

**This is how the text reads – הכי גרסינן בתוספתא מימינו למזרח הדרך –  
in תוספתא; towards his right, which is east of the road**

### OVERVIEW

The תוספתא brought in our גמרא is describing the boundaries of א"י in reference to one who is traveling in a northerly direction from עכו to כזיב. There are two גירסאות; one which reads 'מימינו וכו' and the other reads 'וימינו וכו'. Our גירסא will be discussing what the proper תוספות is.

-----

**ולא גרסינן וימינו<sup>1</sup> דכיון שהולך מעכו לכזיב לעולם הוי ימינו למזרח הדרך -**  
**And the text does not read; and his right side etc.** This cannot be **for since he is traveling from עכו to כזיב**, which is in a northerly direction **his right side always faces towards east of the road**. When traveling from south to north you face north and your right side always faces east.

וימינו' of גירסא attempts to justify תוספות.

**ומיהו יש לומר דפעמים הדרך מתעקם ואין ימינו למזרח:**  
**However, we can say that occasionally the road curves;** the direction of the road is no longer due north, it may be eastward or westward and at that point, as the road curves, **his right side is not facing eastward**. It may be facing north if the road curves westward or it may be facing south if the road curves eastward. Therefore it may be appropriate to be 'וימינו'; indicating that the ensuing law applies only when his right side is towards the east; i.e. when the road is going due north, and not curving (excessively).

### SUMMARY

תוספות prefers the גירסא of 'מימינו' as opposed to 'וימינו'; since when traveling north (from עכו to כזיב) the right side is automatically east. We can however countenance the גירסא of 'וימינו', for when the road veers to the east or west the right side is not (necessarily due) east.

### THINKING IT OVER

What should we assume would be לימינו, if the road curves eastward or westward; would it be א"י or חו"ל?<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> This reading would indicate a stipulation, as if to say when his right side is towards the east, then etc.

Such a reading would indicate that it is possible that his right side does not necessarily face eastward.

<sup>2</sup> See מ"מ.