

כל ששופע ויורד מטורי אמנון –

All that slopes and descends from the אמנון mountains

OVERVIEW

The ת"ק teaches us a dispute between the ר' יהודה and ת"ק concerning the status of the Mediterranean islands. The ת"ק maintains that a line is drawn from טורי אמנון southward to נהל מצרים¹. Any island within this line is א"י. However, ר"י maintains that lines are drawn directly westward towards the (Atlantic) ocean from קפלוריא in the north and נהל מצרים in the south. Whatever² is between these two lines is considered א"י. They both seemingly agree that the summit of טורי אמנון is a border of א"י. Anything that slopes inward from the summit is א"י, and anything that slopes outward from the summit is חו"ל. רש"י and תוספות are disputing as to which border טורי אמנון defines; whether it is the northern border or the western border.

פירוש בקונטרס³ מטורי אמנון ולפנים דהיינו לצד דרום ארץ ישראל -

explains the term 'from the טורי אמנון inwards' meaning southward from the טורי אמנון; that is considered א"י -

ולחוץ לצד צפון חוצה לארץ -

And the term 'outward' meaning northward from the טורי אמנון is considered חו"ל. It appears from רש"י that the טורי אמנון sloped basically in a north-south direction. The summit of טורי אמנון was the northern border of א"י⁴ and ran in an east-west direction. Therefore whatever sloped southward from the summit was א"י and whatever sloped northward was חו"ל.

questions the interpretation of רש"י that the summit of טורי אמנון was the northernmost part of א"י.

וקשה לרבינו יצחק דאם כן אמאי נקט רבי יהודה קפלוריא -

And the ר"י has a difficulty with this interpretation, for if this is so; that the summit of טורי אמנון is the northern border of א"י, why did ר"י choose the city of קפלוריא to designate the northern boundary (of the islands adjacent to א"י) -

הוי ליה למימר רואין כאילו חוט מטוח מטורי אמנון עד אוקיינוס -

¹ It would be helpful to study the inserted map in the ארץ ישראל תלמודית ערך ארץ ישראל.

² See following ד"ה ר"י תוס' ד"ה ר"י as to what this means.

³ בד"ה כל ובד"ה מטורי.

⁴ See רש"י ד"ה כל ששופע וכו' דגובה ההר הוא הגבול.

He should have said instead, we imagine a thread drawn tautly from the
טורי אמנון westward towards the ocean -

כיון דתנא קמא נמי לציין גבול צפוני של ארץ ישראל קאתי -

Since the קמא also intends to designate the northern boundary of
א"י could have used the same marker, the summit of טורי אמנון, to designate his northern starting point. The summit of טורי אמנון, which was the northern border of א"י, ran, according to רש"י, in an east-west direction. All ר"י had to say was that we extend this (imaginary) east - west line directly westward towards the ocean.

תוספות offers a different explanation:

ונראה לרבינו יצחק דטורי אמנון משתפע ויורד לצד מזרח ולצד מערב -

And the ר"י maintains that the טורי אמנון slope and descend towards the east and towards the west (not north and south as רש"י maintains) -

וחודו של הר הוא גבול מערבי של ארץ ישראל -

And the spine of the mountain (i.e. the summit that runs north and south) **is the western boundary of א"י** (towards the north of the הגדול)⁵ -

והנסיך שבסין רואין כאילו חוט מתוח מטורי אמנון כלומר מחודו של הר עד נחל מצרים
And, according to the קמא, the islands in the Mediterranean Sea are viewed as if a thread was drawn from טורי אמנון meaning from the spine of the mountain⁶ which is the (north) western border of א"י. This thread is drawn in a southwesterly direction **until נחל מצרים**; which is (south) southwest of א"י⁷. All islands which are within (east of) this imaginary thread are considered א"י.

וקפלוריא לרבי יהודה אתי לציין נסין שבצפון ארץ ישראל -

And according to ר"י the city of קפלוריא comes to designate the status of the island that are off the northern coast of א"י. ר"י cannot use טורי אמנון as a marker since the spine of טורי אמנון runs north and south. If we were told to draw a line westward from טורי אמנון we would not know how far north on the summit of טורי אמנון should this line begin⁸. Therefore ר"י stated that קפלוריא is the northernmost point in א"י

⁵ According to תוספות, northern א"י did not border on the הגדול; but rather indented inland. At that northern frontier the top (spine) of טורי אמנון was the western border

⁶ תוספות may be alluding that according to רש"י it is not clear from which point of טורי אמנון which runs east-west do we draw the line to נחל מצרים. Even though רש"י maintains that the line is drawn from the westernmost part of the mountain (summit) [see רש"י ד"ה נהל], however it does not say so explicitly in the ברייתא. According to תוספות however it is drawn from the summit. It is basically irrelevant from which part of the summit, as is explained shortly.

⁷ טורי אמנון is the westernmost part of א"י in the north and נחל מצרים is the westernmost part of א"י in the south. The line connecting these two westernmost outposts in א"י, marks the western border of א"י in the הגדול.

⁸ See מהרש"א who comments that even though that on the eastern slope of טורי אמנון we know the northern

and the line westward towards the ocean should begin there. However according to the נהל מצרים to טורי אמנון that the line is drawn in a southwesterly direction from טורי אמנון this line begins. נהל makes little difference where on this north-south spine of טורי אמנון this line begins. נהל is much more southerly than westerly from טורי אמנון. Virtually no island within this line would be affected whether this line would be drawn a relatively small distance north or south on טורי אמנון⁹. When going directly westward, however, every discrepancy from the correct northern border may affect the many islands that lie directly west from the northern border of א"י.

will explain why רש"י assumed that the טורי אמנון proscribe the northern border of א"י תוספות.

ונראה שהכתוב דוחקו לרש"י לפרש כן דכתיב וזה יהיה לכם גבול צפון -

And it seems that רש"י was pressured by the פסוק to interpret it in this manner that טורי אמנון is the northern border, for it is written in the תורה¹⁰ 'and this shall be your northern border -

מן הים הגדול תתאו לכם הר ההר ומתרגמינן הר ההר טורי אמנון -

From the great sea (the Mediterranean which is the western boundary of א"י), direct yourselves towards 'הר ההר'; which is the northern boundary of א"י as the פסוק clearly states 'וזה יהיה לכם גבול צפון', and the translation of the תרגום¹¹ for the words הר ההר is טורי אמנון -

אלמא הכתוב בא לציין גבול צפוני -

It is evident that the פסוק intends to designate that the northern boundary of א"י is טורי אמנון. This bodes well according to רש"י that the summit of טורי אמנון runs in an east west direction, and slopes in a north south direction, whereby the summit is the northern border of א"י. However according to תוספות that טורי אמנון designates the western border of א"י, how can we reconcile this with the פסוק that clearly indicates that טורי אמנון designates the northern border of א"י.

border of א"י, however we cannot draw this line from this border because the (height of the) mountain itself interferes. We will not know where precisely on the summit of the mountain the border is. It would seem that קפלוריא was either at the summit (or the western slope!) of the mountain and the line could be drawn from there. See מהר"ם שי"ף. See תוספות הרא"ש who states that קפלוריא was a mountain atop הר ההר sloping in a north south direction (as opposed to הר ההר proper which sloped east west) making it the northern border of א"י.

⁹ It may even be that the טורי אמנון were not perfectly aligned in a north-south direction; rather they were aligned in a slight northeast-southwest direction. Therefore from wherever on the summit of טורי אמנון the lines would be drawn to נהל מצרים it would be virtually the same line, because of the aforementioned slight angle.

¹⁰ במדבר (מסעי) לד, ז.

¹¹ The gloss to the גמרא notes that we do not find such a תרגום in our editions. However in our ינותן it is translated as אומנוס טורי. See מהר"ץ חיות.

ומיהו יכול להיות שההר תקוע בקרן צפונית מערבית אבל משפע ויורד לצד מזרח¹² -

However it is possible that that the mountain is planted in the northwestern corner of א"י; however it slopes and descends towards the east. Therefore טורי אמנון has a dual function; it designates the northern border¹³ as indicated in the פסוק, as well as the western border as indicated in the ברייתא.

SUMMARY

According to רש"י the summit of טורי אמנון defines the northern border of א"י. The summit of טורי אמנון runs in an east-west direction while the mountain slopes in a north-south direction.

According to תוספות the summit of טורי אמנון defines the western border of א"י. The summit of טורי אמנון runs in a north south direction, while the mountain slopes in an east-west direction.

טורי ר"י use רש"י for according to רש"י, why did not ר"י use טורי as his northern border instead of קפלוריא.

Even though the פסוק of וזה יהיה לכם גבול צפון וגו' seems to support רש"י that טורי אמנון are the northern border; nevertheless, we can say that טורי אמנון functions as the western border as well, since it is located in the northwestern sector of א"י.

THINKING IT OVER

1. Is קפלוריא in א"י or in חו"ל; according to רש"י? תוס' רש"י?
2. According to תוספות that the summit of טורי אמנון ran in a north-south direction, where would the גבול צפון of א"י most likely be; near the southern tip of טורי אמנון, near the northern tip, or somewhere in between?¹⁴

¹² See מהר"ם שי"ף who adds to the text of תוספות the words: 'ומצד זה לצד מערב כדפירישיית'; 'and from the other side westward as I have explained'.

¹³ See 'Thinking it over' # 2.

¹⁴ See אמ"ה # 33 and נח"מ.