

רב הונא¹ אמר נגודי מנגדינן להו – said, we surely smite them רב הונא

OVERVIEW

The **ברייתא** rules that a **כהן** cannot collect a debt from his divorced wife only through a third party. **רב** said if they appear together in **בי"ד**, we do not pay attention to them. **רב** said we excommunicate (**שמתא**) them. **רב** said we punish them with lashes. **תוספות** explains that according to **ר' הבהדר** we give them lashes in addition to the **שמתא**.

נראה לרבינו **תם** דלרב הונא נמי משמתינן וגם מנגדינן שכל אחד מחמיר מחבירו² -
It is the view of the **ר"ת** that according to **ר"ה** as well, we place a **שמתא** on them (as **רב** stated), and we also excommunicate them, for each of these three are more stringent than the previous colleague -

ואם הוא אומר דנגדינן ליה בלא שמתא הוה מיקל טפי³ -
For if **ר"ה** meant that we (only) smite them (but) without a **שמתא**, then he would be more lenient than **ר"פ** (who requires that a **שמתא** be placed on them), because a **שמתא** alone is more severe than lashes alone.

תוספות proves that **שמתא** is more severe than lashes:

כדאמרינן במועד קטן (דף יז,א) ובפרק מקום שנהגו (פסחים נב,א) -
As the **גמרא** states in **מ"ק** and in **שנהגו** and in **מסכת מו"ק** -

במערבא כי מחייב צורבא מרבנן מימנו אנגידא ולא מימנו אשמתא:
In Israel, when a student scholar is liable for a disciplinary action the **בי"ד** will form a quorum to smite him, but they will not assemble to place a **שמתא** on him; for that is too severe a punishment for a **צורבא מרבנן**.⁴

SUMMARY

ר"ה requires **מלקות** besides the **שמתא**. A **שמתא** is more severe than **מלקות**.

THINKING IT OVER

Why does the **גמרא** omit the word **נמי** from our **ר"ה** text?

¹ In our **גמרא** it reads **אמר ר' יהושע** **בריה דרב יהושע**.

² **רב** said we do not pay them attention, and **רב** added that we (also) place them in a **שמתא** (which is obviously more severe than not paying attention to them), and (presumably) **ר"ה** adds (an additional severity) that we smite them (however smiting alone is not more severe than **שמתא** [as **תוספות** points out shortly]), therefore we must say that **ר"ה** adds lashes to the **שמתא** (of **ר"פ**).

³ assumption is that each one is more strict than the previous one; **ר"פ** more than **ר"ש** and **ר"ה** more than **ר"פ**.

⁴ See **ר"ה** **ד"ה** **מימנו** in **פסחים** that **שמתא** means either **שם מיתה** or **שממה יהיה**. See also **ר"ה** **ד"ה** **מימנו** there that **שמתא** means either **שם מיתה** or **שממה יהיה**.