

Perhaps it is corrupted

דילמא משבשתא היא -

Overview

The cited two ברייתות regarding when one should stop eating on ע"ש ועיו"ט; the first stated מתשע (תשע שעות ומחצה) (which is מן המנחה ולמעלה) and the second stated משנה (שמוך למנחה) (which is שעות). The first does not pose any difficulty with our משנה, while the second does.¹ Mr. Zutra argued that perhaps the second ברייתא is incorrect, for it should have stated, מתשע שעות ומחצה. Our תוספות explains why Mr. Zutra assumed that the second ברייתא is incorrect as opposed to the first ברייתא.

וברייתא קמייתא דקתני מן המנחה ולמעלה היא עיקר -

And the first ברייתא states that the prohibition of eating on ע"ש ועיו"ט is from (תשע שעות ומחצה) מנחה onwards is the correct version -

משום דלדידיה אתיא מתניתין ככולי עלמא:

Because according to the first ברייתא our משנה is in accordance with everyone.

Summary

The view of the first ברייתא coincides with the view of our משנה according to all.

Thinking it over

explains that the first ברייתא is the עיקר, since the משנה then follows the view of both ר"י and ר"י. Is there any reason why we would think that the second ברייתא is the עיקר, so that it is necessary for תוספות to disabuse us of that notion?³

¹ According to the second ברייתא why did our משנה not include ע"ש ועיו"ט, since the prohibition is the same (שמוך למנחה) by both ע"ש ועיו"ט and ע"פ. These views (מן המנחה) are according to ר' יהודה, while ר' יוסי maintains that there are no prohibitions and one may eat until nightfall.

² Our משנה stated that one may not eat שמוך למנחה on ע"פ (only), indicating that on ע"ש ועיו"ט, one may eat למנחה, however according to the second ברייתא it is forbidden to eat שמוך למנחה even on ע"ש ועיו"ט, according to ר"י. The משנה seemingly disagrees with this view of ר' יהודה; otherwise why limit the prohibition to ע"פ, when it applies to ע"ש ועיו"ט as well. However according to the first ברייתא it is understood (even according to ר' יהודה) why the משנה mentioned only ע"פ since on ע"פ (only) the איסור begins למנחה, while on ע"ש ועיו"ט the prohibition begins only מן המנחה, but not שמוך למנחה.

³ Which ברייתא seems more precise; the first (מן המנחה), or the second (מתשע שעות). See previous המנחה תוס' ד"ה מן המנחה.