

שינוי¹ יין אין צריך לברך –

A change of wine does not necessitate a blessing

Overview

The **ברייתא** teaches that if one is drinking wine and they brought him new wine from a different barrel, he is not required to recite a new **הגפן בורא פרי**. Our **תוספות** discusses the **הטוב והמטיב** of the **ברכה**.

מיהו הטוב והמטיב צריך לברך כדאמרין בהרואה² (שם דף נט, ב) -

Nonetheless (even though one does not make a new **גפן**), **he is required to recite** the **ברכה** of **הטוב והמטיב**, as the **גמרא** states in **הרואה** -

ופירש רשב"ם³ דווקא היכא דמשובח מן הראשון וכן בהלכות גדולות⁴ -

And the רשב"ם explained that this rule is specifically where the new wine is better than the first wine, and is it also ruled so in the **הלכות גדולות** -

וכן משמע בירושלמי דסוף כיצד מברכין⁵ -

And it also seems so in the תלמוד ירושלמי at the end of מברכין -

דקאמר אבא בר רב הונא אמר יין חדש וישן⁶ צריך לברך⁷ שינוי יין אין צריך לברך⁸ -

Where it states, 'הונא בר רב הונא' ruled, new wine and old wine requires a blessing, a mere change of wine does not require a blessing -

שינוי מקום צריך לברך⁹ היסח הדעת כמו שהוא שינוי מקום -

A change of place requires a blessing; if his mind was distracted from drinking any more wine, it is just like a change of place⁹ and a new blessing is required, even if he remains in the same place. This concludes the quote from the ירושלמי -

משמע שרוצה לומר דיין חדש וישן צריך לברך לפי שהישן טוב מן החדש -

It seems that he wants to say that if one was first drinking new wine, and then they brought old wine, he is required to recite הטוב והמטיב, since old wine is better than new wine -

¹ עמוד ב' is (seemingly) referencing the **גמרא** on the **תוספות**.

² We cite the **גמרא** there; אבל **צ** לברך אין א"צ לברך אבל. אומר ברוך הטוב והמטיב. There is no mention there whether the new wine must be better than the original wine.

³ Here אחד.

⁴ The **הלכות גדולות** was written in the time of the **גאונים** and is generally attributed to **קירא**, while others attribute it to **יהודאי גאון**.

⁵ ברכות פ"ה ה"ה.

⁶ **יין חדש** is when it is less than forty days from when the grapes were pressed, and **יין ישן** is when it is more than forty days and the fermentation process is ongoing.

⁷ This refers to **הטוב והמטיב**.

⁸ This refers to both **בפה"ג** and **הטוב והמטיב**.

⁹ This refers to **בפה"ג**.

אבל שינוי יין סתם אין צריך לברך כיון שאין ידוע¹⁰ שהשני משובח -

However, a mere change in wine does not require a blessing (of הטוה"מ) since it is not known that the second (new) wine is better, than what he was drinking. This seems to support the view of the רשב"ם and the ב"ה. Now תוספות offers an opposing view -

מיהו עובדא דבתר הכי פליג עליה דקאמר דעל כל חבית וחבית מברך -

However, the incident that follows there (in the ירושלמי) argues with this view, for it stated that רבי recites a blessing for the wine from each and every barrel -

מה היה מברך ואמר רבי יצחק בשם רבי ברוך הטוב והמטיב -

What blessing did he recite; so ר"י said in the name of ר"ב, the blessing of הטוה"מ -

משמע בכל ענין אפילו מטבא לבישא¹¹ -

This indicates that they made a הטוה"מ in any event, even from good wine to bad wine. This would indicate that even if we know that the second wine is inferior, הטוה"מ needs to be recited -

מיהו יש לדחות שהיה מברך לפי שלא היה מכיר¹² אבל אם ידוע שהשני גרוע לא -

However, we can disregard this conclusion and say that he recited הטוה"מ for each new barrel, because he was not aware whether it was better or not, however if it was known that the second barrel was inferior, he would not recite הטוה"מ -

תוספות offers his view:

ונראה דאפילו השני גרוע מברך¹³ דעל ריבוי יינות הוא מברך -

And it appears to תוספות that even if the second wine is inferior, he recites the הטוה"מ, since the blessing is on the multitude of wines, therefore he makes the הטוה"מ -
ובלבד שלא יהיה האחרון רע יותר מדאי שאין יכולין לשתותו אלא מדחק -

Provided that the last one is not so very bad that one can barely drink it -

וצריך לברך הטוב והמטיב בין בשעת סעודה בין שלא בשעת סעודה¹⁴ -

And it is necessary to recite הטוה"מ whether one is drinking wine during a meal, or whether one is drinking wine not during a meal -

ויחיד אין צריך לברך אי ליכא אחרינא בהדיה כדמוכח בהרואה¹⁵ (שם) -

¹⁰ When the second wine is brought, we cannot know whether it is better than the first until we drink it, therefore we cannot make a הטוב והמטיב. However, if the second wine is aged more, we know that it is of a better quality.

¹¹ The ירושלמי merely states על כל חבית וחבית regardless of the quality.

¹² See footnote # 10. רבי did not know whether the new wine was inferior or not until he tasted it.

¹³ תוספות disagrees with the רשב"ם and maintains that not only is there no requirement that the second wine need to be superior to the first wine, but even if we know that it is inferior, הטוה"מ is recited.

¹⁴ See 'Thinking it over'.

¹⁵ שינוי of גמרא. The גמרא states that הטוה"מ is only made if it is good for him and his friend. It cites our שינוי and qualifies it that הטוה"מ is recited only if דשתו בהדיה. Also הטוב means for the person reciting the ברכה and הטוב refers to his friend.

But an individual is not required to recite the "מ" if there is no one else drinking with him, as is evident in פרק הירואה -

ודוקא ביין מברכין לפי שזיבלו כרמיהן בדמיהן של ישראל¹⁶ –

And we recite the "מ" only by wine, because they (the Romans) fertilized their vineyards with Jewish blood from the people whom they killed in ביתר, for seven years, and the blessing of the "מ" was instituted¹⁷ for the

והטוב שלא הסריחו והמטיב שניתנו לקבורה¹⁸ [ועיין תוספות ברכות נט, ב דיבור המתחיל הטוב]:

And the word הטוב is thanking ה' that their bodies did not become putrid, and the word והמטיב is thanking ה' that permission was granted to bury them.

Summary

According to the רשב"ם the ברכה of the "מ" is only made if the second wine is better than the first, however תוספות maintains that the "מ" is always recited unless the second wine can hardly be drunk. The "מ" is only for wine and only if there is more than one person drinking.

Thinking it over

¹⁹ בשעת הסעודה whether it is בשעת הסעודה or not writes that we recite the "מ" תוספות. Why would we even think that there should be a difference whether it is בשעת הסעודה or not?²⁰

¹⁶ See גיטין נז, א at the very bottom.

¹⁷ See ברכות מה, ב.

¹⁸ The הרוגי ביתר were lying on the open field for an extended period of time before the Romans finally gave permission to bury them. The ברכה of the "מ" was instituted as a fourth ברכה in ברהמ"ז, and since it is associated with vineyards, the ברכה of the "מ" is made also for שינוי יין, (and) because wine is similar in appearance to blood. See תוס' תענית לא, א, ד"ה תיקנו.

¹⁹ See footnote # 14.

²⁰ See מהרש"א א.