

וְנִימְרִינְהוּ לְתַרְוִייהוּ אֶחָד כֶּסֶא - And let us recite both of them over one cup

Overview

The ר' יהודה stated that when the Friday meal continues into שבת, according to ר' יהודה, one (immediately) first makes ברכת המזון on a cup of wine and then קידוש on another cup of wine;¹ however יוסי ר' (allows them to finish the meal and then) one first recites ברהמ"ז over a כוס, followed by קידוש over a second כוס.² The גמרא asks why the need for two cups of wine, let them recite the ברהמ"ז and קידוש on the same cup. תוספות qualifies this question.

לרבי יוסי פריך כיון דתרווייהו אסעודת שבת קאתו כדפרישית לעיל³ (דף ק,א) -

The question is being asked on יוסי ר', for since both cups of wine are coming for the שבת meal, as I explained previously -

דהך סעודה עולה לו לסעודת שבת⁴ הוה ליה למימר תרווייהו אחד כסא -

That with this meal he is fulfilling his obligation of eating שבת; there it is appropriate that he should recite both the ברהמ"ז and the קידוש over one כוס -

אבל לרבי יהודה לא פריך כיון דברכת המזון אסעודת חול⁵ וקידוש על סעודה הבאה -

However no challenge is presented according to ר' יהודה, for since the ברהמ"ז is for the Friday weekday meal, and the קידוש will be recited for the upcoming שבת meal -

אין לומר שניהם על כוס אחד:

It is inappropriate to recite them both (the weekday ברהמ"ז, and the [later] שבת) over one and the same כוס (קידוש)

Summary

The s'gמרא question is only on יוסי ר', but not on ר' יהודה, since according to ר' יהודה, it would be inappropriate to make both blessings on one cup

¹ This is תוספות opinion (see the previous ראשון ד"ה ר' יהודה).

² Even though the קידוש is being said after the meal, nevertheless it is considered a סעודה במקום, since the קידוש is recited immediately after the meal.

³ (TIE footnote # 5 & 6) ד"ה רבי יוסי.

⁴ שבת ר' allows them to continue eating this Friday meal into שבת. When they finish eating it is already well into שבת. They will no longer eat. This is considered their שבת meal. Therefore the ברהמ"ז is for a שבת meal and the קידוש במקום (see footnote # 2) is also for the same שבת meal. It is therefore appropriate that since both blessings are for the same meal that they could be recited over one כוס.

⁵ ר' יהודה maintains that they must interrupt the Friday meal with the onset of שבת, and recite ברהמ"ז for the Friday meal. The קידוש is recited later whenever they decide to have the שבת meal (see previous ראשון ד"ה ר' יהודה TIE footnote # 2). See 'Thinking it over' # 1.

Thinking it over

1. Is the main reason for the inappropriateness to make both blessings on one cup, because one is for a weekday meal and the other for a שבת meal, or because they are for two separate meals, or because they can be separated in time as well?⁶

2. The גמרא answers this question ('אין עושין מצות חבילות וכו'); obviously the מקשן was not aware of this concept; so perhaps the גמרא was asking on יהודה ר' as well, however the מקשן was equally unaware of תוספות distinction. Why is תוספות so certain that the question is only on יוסי ר'?!⁷

⁶ See footnote # 5.

⁷ See יגיעות מרדכי and רשב"ם ד"ה ונימרינהו on the מהרש"א.