

דאית ליה ואמר רב יקנ"ה¹ - Where he has it, and Rav said; Y.K.N.H.

Overview

The גמרא ruled that we do not say two קדושות over one כוס (except in a situation where he only has one כוס). The גמרא asked but רב ruled in a case where יו"ט occurred after שבת (on Sunday) where we need to say קידוש and הבדלה that the order is יקנ"ה. In any event he certainly has plenty wine on פסח (as the משנה taught 'אל יפחתו וכו' and nevertheless he makes two קדושות (which are קידוש והבדלה) over one יין כוס. Our תוספות discusses why are we so assured that he has enough wine for both קידוש and הבדלה separately.

פירש בקונטרס² דסלקא דעתין דביום טוב ראשון של פסח מיירי דאית ליה כוסות טובא -
The רשב"ם explained that we assumed that this ruling of רב (of יקנ"ה) is discussing the first day of the פסח, יו"ט פסח, where a person has many cups of wine, so there should be no problem of making קידוש and הבדלה on two separate כוסות of wine -

כדתנן (לעיל דף צט,ב) לא יפחתו לו מד' כוסות -
As the משנה stated, 'they (the גבאי צדקה) should not give him (a poor person) less than four cups' of wine; so we can be assured that there is sufficient wine -

questions this explanation:

וקשה דהא כל ד' כוסות צריכי כל חד למילתיה³ -
And there is a difficulty with this explanation, for all the four cups of wine are required each one for its purpose, so there is not sufficient wine for both קידוש והבדלה, for then we will need a fifth cup -

An additional question:⁴

ועוד דבסמוך דפריך⁵ מיקנה"ז⁶ לימא דבשמיני של חג מיירי⁷ -

¹ This is the ראשי תיבות which stands for - הבדלה, נר, קידוש, גר, היבנות -

² See רשב"ם ד"ה דאית.

³ The first cup for (והבדלה) קידוש, the second for the הגדה, the third for ברהמ"ז, and the fourth for הלל. Therefore even if he has four cups of wine, he still will not have enough to make קידוש והבדלה on two separate cups.

⁴ The גמרא answered the question by saying that since רב said יקנ"ה (but not יקנה"ז [see footnote # 5]), meaning that he is not saying שהחיינו, this indicates that we are discussing שביעי של פסח (where no שהחיינו is recited), and by then he finished all the wine except for one כוס.

⁵ The גמרא continued to ask, but we do find (by רבא) a ruling of יקנה"ז, which seemingly indicates that it is on the first day of פסח, and nevertheless we make קידוש והבדלה on one כוס (even though he has sufficient wine).

⁶ This ראשי תיבות stands for (שהחיינו) זמן, הבדלה, נר, קידוש, גר, היבנות. [The question of the גמרא is from the ruling of אביי (which is יקנ"ה) as well. The תוספות just mentions one of them (the one we accept להלכה).]

⁷ See 'Thinking it over'.

And additionally, the גמרא shortly asks from the ruling of יקנה"ז; the גמרא could have answered that we are discussing שמיני עצרת -

דאיכא זמן ואכיל ושתה כל מה דהוה ליה -

When we do say שהחיינו, but he already ate and drank up all the wine which he had. This would (seemingly) answer the question; why did the גמרא not answer this.

A final question:⁸

ועוד דאכיל כל מה דהוה ליה לשון אכילה לא היה לו להזכיר אכוסות -

And furthermore, the גמרא answered that 'he ate up all that he had'; the גמרא should not have used the term eating regarding the cups of wine, rather the גמרא should have said, 'he drank up all the wine he had'.

Tosfos offers his explanation:⁹

לכך נראה לפרש דביום טוב ראשון מסתמא אדם מכין הרבה¹⁰ -

Therefore it appears to Tosfos that the explanation is that presumably a person prepares a lot of (food and) wine for the first day of יו"ט –

ובשמיני now deals with the question from יקנה"ז:¹¹

ובשמיני של חג נמי שהוא רגל בפני עצמו רגילין להכין הרבה¹² -

And also on יו"ט (סוכות) it is customary to make large preparations for the חג, so therefore there will also be plenty of wine. Tosfos proves that large preparations are made for שמע"צ -

כדתנן (חולין דף פג,א) ד' פרקים בשנה צריך הטבח להודיע אמה מכרתי לשחוט¹³ -

As the משנה states; four times a year the butcher is required to inform his customer who is buying a cow, 'I already sold the mother of this cow for slaughter' -

⁸ The גמרא answered the initial question (of יקנה"ה) by saying it was on פסח של שביעי, where he already ate up whatever he had.

⁹ We want to understand why are we assuming that he has enough wine to make both קידוש והבדלה on two כוסות.

¹⁰ The (יקנה"ה) ruling of רב applies to people in general (not specifically to the poor). People in general usually are prepared with much wine before יו"ט. We need not take into account (regarding the ruling of יקנה"ה) only the people who cannot afford and are given (only) four כוסות, but rather also the general population who have plenty of wine.

¹¹ See footnote # 5. Tosfos asked how do we know that this (יקנה"ז) is on the first day of פסח, perhaps we are discussing (שש"פ גמרא asked regarding שמע"צ, where he already (ate and) drank up all his wine (as the גמרא asked regarding שמע"צ).

¹² We cannot say (as suggested in footnote # 10) that by the time שמע"צ comes, he drank up all the wine, for we make preparations anew and aplenty for שמע"צ.

¹³ The תורה informs us (ויקרא [אמור] כב,ה) that one may not slaughter a cow and its parent on the same day. Therefore if the butcher already sold the mother cow and someone else wants to buy its offspring, the butcher is obligated to inform him that the mother was already purchased for שחיטה, and so you will not be able to be שוחט the child today. This law applies only those times where people are preparing great feasts, and so we can assume that whoever is purchasing a cow will slaughter it that day, therefore the butcher must inform them.

וחשיב יו"ט¹⁴ האחרון¹⁵ של חג:

And he counts שמע"צ as one of the four times.

Summary

We assume that everyone has sufficient wine (for the two כוסות needed for קידוש (רשב"ם), either because everyone (even the poor) are supplied with wine (רשב"ם), or (שמע"צ) because everyone makes large preparations for יו"ט (including שמע"צ).

Thinking it over

asks on the רשב"ם, when the גמרא asked from יקנה"ז (which seems to indicate we are discussing the first day of פסח), the גמרא should have answered that not necessarily so, we could be discussing שמע"צ (where he used up his wine).¹⁶ According to תוספות when the גמרא initially asked from יקנ"ה (and we assumed it was the first day of פסח and he had wine), why did not the גמרא answer that it could have been the first day of סוכות, or שבועות (where he did not have enough wine), just as תוספות asked perhaps it was שמע"צ?¹⁷

¹⁴ Actually it is the day before שמע"צ (or הושע"ר). We see that there is much preparations for שמע"צ, therefore there will be plenty of wine, Therefore establishing יקנה"ז for שמע"צ will not answer the question how can he make קידוש on one כוס, since he has plenty of wine.

¹⁵ See there רש"י ביום ד"ה who writes, והביב עליהן, הוא לעצמו הוא וחביב עליהן.

¹⁶ See footnote # 7.

¹⁷ See מהרש"א א.