

ולהך לישנא דאדם טועה שעה ומשהו ניכול עד סוף חמש –

And according to this view that a person errs an hour and somewhat, we should eat until the end of the fifth hour

OVERVIEW

The גמרא asked that according to the view that a person errs up to a שעה ומשהו (but no more) one should be allowed to eat חמץ until סוף חמש (since he will never mistake שבע for סוף; for it is more than a שעה ומשהו). It would seem that this question (that חמץ should be permitted to be eaten until סוף חמש) is only according to those who maintain that a person is not טועה more than a שעה ומשהו; however those that maintain that person is טועה ב' שעות, then it is understood that we cannot eat חמץ in שעה חמש for he may mistake שבע שעה for שעה חמש and eat חמץ בשעה שבע. Our תוספות negates this view.

אפילו טעה בשתי שעות היה יכול להקשות ניכול עד סוף חמש –

Even if one errs as much as two hours the גמרא could have asked ‘we should eat until the end of the fifth hour’; for we cannot be concerned that he will mistake the seventh hour for the fifth hour (since it is less than two hours). The reason there is no concern is -

שבחמש חמה במזרח ובשבע חמה במערב¹:

For in the fifth hour the sun is in the eastern part of the sky **and in the seventh hour** the sun is in the **western** part of the sky. No one will confuse the seventh hour with the fifth hour; therefore according to everyone we should be permitted to eat חמץ until the end of the fifth hour.

SUMMARY

Everyone agrees that no one will mistake the seventh hour for the fifth hour; since בחמש חמה במזרח ובשבע חמה במערב.

THINKING IT OVER

בה' states that even if one is טועה ב' שעות, he would also be permitted to eat בה' because חמה במזרח ובז' חמה במערב; indicating that at this point we are already aware of this distinction. However from the question later in the גמרא that ה' לא ה' and the subsequent answer וכו' חמה במזרח וכו', this indicates that previously the גמרא did not take this distinction into consideration. How can תוספות claim at this point that even if טועה ב' שעות he would be permitted to eat בה'?²

¹ See the משנה cited previously on יא, ב.

² See רש"ש and מהרש"א [הארוך].