

And Rabi Yochanon said, etc.

ואמר רבי יוחנן וכולי –

OVERVIEW

ר' explained the reason it was necessary to establish the משנה in a רה"ר (even though the כלי is a לישאל בו דעת לישאל) is because there was a person involved in the transference of the טומאה (to the כלי) and therefore the rule of ברה"י ספק טומאה applies (even by a דעת בו דעת).

הוי מצי לאתויי דזעירי¹ דמשני (נדה דף ה,ב) דמעת לעת שבנדה עושה משכב ומושב -

The גמרא could have cited that which זעירי answered regarding the rule that a נדה makes a משכב ומושב (for twenty four hours prior to her seeing דם), that-

אף על גב דמשכב ומושב אין בו דעת לישאל כשחברותיה נושאות² אותה במטה:

Even though the משכב ומושב have no לישאל דעת nevertheless they are טמא when her friends carry the נדה in the bed, the same would apply here. תוספות offers no explanation here.³

SUMMARY

Here it is more than כהן is holding the סכין even זעירי will agree that it is לישאל י"ש בו דעת לישאל.

THINKING IT OVER

Where is the לישאל more effective (to make it טמא); if it is by the דבר הנטמא or by the מטמא?⁴

¹ The rule is that a נדה is מטמא למפרע (before she actually saw דם) for a מעת לעת anything that she touched (for the חכמים were concerned that perhaps she became טמא before she actually realized it). The rule is (therefore) that if a נדה was lying in a bed, the bed receives the status of משכב נדה (which can be מטמא אדם וכלים) up to a מעל"ע prior to her becoming a נדה. The גמרא asked (since it is a ספק whether she was טמא for the prior מעל"ע) why is the bed טמא since the bed is a דעת בו דעת. זעירי answered that we are discussing a case where her friends were carrying her in the bed so they are like the bed and since they have לישאל the bed is טמא. The גמרא continues that according to ר' who maintains עליה טומאה הבאה בידי אדם נשאלין עליה יוחנן the bed will be טמא even if no one is carrying it since the נדה is לישאל so it is a טומאה הבאה בידי אדם.

² (נשאלין עליה) it is בא ע"י אדם (that even if it is just אדם מחמיר) ר' יוחנן is asking why was it necessary to cite זעירי who is מקיל and requires that a person has to be actively holding the המטמא (her friends need to be carrying the bed), nevertheless here it will be considered here as a דבר שנשאלין עליו since the כהן is holding the סכין (which is the equivalent of her friends carrying the bed).

³ See תוספות נדה ה,ב ד"ה כשחברותיה for some explanations.

⁴ See עיי"ש. נדה ה,ב כשחברותיה in ח"י רע"א.