

הא רבי שמעון אליבא דרבי יהושע –

This is *Rabi Shimon* according to *Rabi Yehoshuah*

OVERVIEW

The *גמרא* explained that ר' יהושע in our משנה who permits being תלויה תרומה is the view of ר"ש according to ר"י. Our תוספות explains the term תלויה according to ר"ש.

תוספות asks:

תימה לרבינו יצחק לרבי שמעון כיון דשרי תלויה לטמא ביד אם כן¹ שרי לשורפו -

The ר"י is astounded! According to ר"ש, since it is permitted to actively be *תרומה תלויה* by hand, this means that it is permitted to burn -

ואמאי קרי ליה תלויה² דתלויה היינו לא אוכלין ולא שורפין -

So why according to ר"ש is *תרומה טמאה* called תלויה, for תלויה means it cannot be eaten and it cannot be burnt; however according to ר"ש it can be burnt!

תוספות answers there is a difference between *תרומה טמאה* and תלויה:

ויש לומר דתלויה לרבי שמעון היינו דלא מחייב לשורפו:

And one can say; that according to ר"ש it is called תלויה, meaning that one is not obligated to burn it (as one is obligated to burn *תרומה טמאה*)³.

SUMMARY

תלויה (according to ר"ש) means that one [may but] is not obligated to burn it.

THINKING IT OVER

1. The *גמרא* previously had already taught us that one is permitted to be *תרומה טמאה* according to ר"ש; why did not תוספות ask his question there; why wait until the question and answer was presented by ריב"ה?⁴

2. Why indeed, are we not obligated to burn תלויה?⁵

¹ *תרומה טמאה* is to be burnt. If one is permitted לכתחלה to be *תרומה טמאה* it is tantamount to saying that it can be burnt (for that is what will happen to it after it becomes *תרומה טמאה*). What is the difference between *תרומה טמאה* and תלויה?

² תלויה means suspended (it is hanging in mid-air) we do not eat it (like *טהורה*), nor do we burn it (like *טמאה*).

³ See *שבת כה*, that רב states that it is a מצוה to burn *תרומה שנשמאת*. See תוספות there כך ד"ה whether this is a מצוה מדרבנן or מדאורייתא.

⁴ See מהרש"א.

⁵ See קובץ ענינים and footnote # 3.