

והלכתא אידי ואידי ברותחין –

And the law is, each of them with boiling water

OVERVIEW

אשי ruled that in order to *Kasher Chometz* knives for פסח, it is necessary to preform ליבון (making it glowing hot by using a torch) for the metal blade, and to immerse the handle in boiling water (הגעלה); there is no need to preform ליבון for the handle. The גמרא concluded however that הגעלה is sufficient for both the handle and the blade; ליבון is not necessary (even) for the blade. תוספות reconciles our ruling with other seemingly contradictory rulings.

תוספות asks:

תימה דתניא בתוספתא דעבודה זרה¹ הסכין והשפוד והאסכלא² מלבנן באור -

It is astounding! For we learnt in the תוספתא of ע"ז 'the knife, the spit and the grill, require ליבון in fire' (and הגעלה is not sufficient) –

גמרא cites another (contradictory) תוספות:

ובפרק קמא דחולין (דף ח,ב ושם) אמר³ כגון שליבנה באור אלמא צריך ליבון -

And in the first פרק of מסכת חולין גמרא states; for instance he performed ליבון in fire for this knife; it is evident from these two גמרות that ליבון is required in order to *Kasher* a knife; why does the גמרא rule here that הגעלה is sufficient?!

תוספות answers:

ותירץ רבינו תם דאמר בירושלמי דמיירי בסכינים ארוכים שצולין בהם בשר דומיא דשפוד⁴ -

And the ת"ת answered that in the ירושלמי it states regarding the תוספתא (mentioned above) that it is discussing long knives which are used to roast meat on them, similar to the spit which is also mentioned there -

וכן ההוא דחולין -

And similarly that גמרא in חולין is also discussing knives upon which meat is roasted; however here we are discussing knives which are used merely to cut חמץ (or hot חמץ products), but

¹ פ"ט ה"ב.

² This is referring to one who bought these items from a נכרי; he must *kasher* them through ליבון.

³ The גמרא there (א,ח) stated that one is permitted to use the knife of an עכו"ם to *Shecht*. The גמרא explains how this is possible since there may be fats from נבילות which were absorbed in the knife.

⁴ The knives (in the תוספתא and חולין) are like spits; the meat is roasted on them, therefore there is much absorption and they need to be *koshered* in same manner they were used; namely on the fire (which is ליבון). However regular knives used for cutting meat (or hot חמץ) since they did not absorb the meat on the fire, but merely by cutting hot meat, in that case הגעלה is sufficient.

are not used on the fire directly.

תוספות offers another distinction between the cases:

ועוד יש לחלק בין התירא בלע ובין איסורא בלע כדמחלק רב אשי בשילהי מסכת עבודה זרה -
And furthermore we can distinguish between a case (חמץ) **where** the knife **absorbed** something **permissible** (the חמץ is permissible when it was absorbed; in which case הגעלה is sufficient), **and** a case (ע"ז) where the knives **absorbed** **something** prohibited (in which case ליבון is required) **as רב אשי** himself **differentiated in the end of ע"ז מסכת** that by התירא בלע, then הגעלה is sufficient –

תוספות responds to an anticipated difficulty:

והא דמצריך להו רב אשי הכא ליבון מחמיר על עצמו⁵ היה:
And the reason רב אשי here **required for them to do ליבון** (even though it was (התירא בלע) that is because **he was strict regarding himself**; however according to the letter of the law, הגעלה would be sufficient since התירא בלע.

SUMMARY

ליבון is required for knives either where it was used directly on the fire or where it was איסורא בלע; otherwise הגעלה is sufficient.

THINKING IT OVER

1. What will be the ruling if the knife was בולע on the fire; however it was התירא בלע? איסורא בלע through fire (just heat) but בולע; or the reverse, it was not בולע but התירא בלע?
2. Why is there a difference if התירא בלע (like חמץ) or איסורא בלע (like נבילה); if it is something after the הגעלה, it should be אסור even if התירא בלע, since now it is איסורא?⁷

⁵ When רב אשי responded to רבינא, he was not merely telling רבינא what to do, but rather he explained to רבינא what he (רב אשי) does, as is evident from the final response of רב אשי (saying חדתא כאמינא).

⁶ See שו"ע אדה"ז סי' תנא סעי' יג בקו"א שם וסעיף כה.

⁷ See דבר שמואל (בד"ה ותירוצו).