

One should not eat close to *Minchah*

סמוך למנחה לא יאכל –

Overview

The משנה teaches that one may not eat ¹ (מצה עשירה) on סמוך למנחה (in order that he should eat the מצה with an appetite). Tosfos reconciles this ruling with other seemingly contradictory rulings.

Tosfos asks:

ואם תאמר והא אמר בכל שעה (לעיל דף מ,א) בציקות של נכרים² ממלא אדם כריסו מהם -

And if you will say, but רב הונא stated in כל שעה, 'a person may fill his stomach with the baked dough of נכרים (if it has no sign of חמץ) on the night סדר -

ובלבד שיאכל כזית מצה באחרונה³ והכא אסר לאכול אפילו מבעוד יום⁴ -

Provided that he eats a מצה at the end'; but here he is prohibited eating מצה even while it is still day?!

Tosfos answers:

ויש לומר דבאותה הסעודה אדם נזהר ואינו אוכל כל שובעו⁵ כדי שיאכל מצה לתיאבון -

And one can say; that in the very same meal, a person is careful (when eating the בציקות של נכרים) and he will not eat until he is completely satiated, in order that he should eat the מצה with an appetite -

אבל מבעוד יום אין אדם נזהר ואוכל כל שובעו וסבר שעד הלילה יתאוה -

However when he eats while it is still day, a person is not that careful and he eats until he is completely satiated, for he assumes that by nighttime he will have an appetite for the מצה -

ואדרבה יהיה שבע יותר כי יתברך המאכל במעיו⁶ -

But the truth is on the contrary that he will be even more satiated, since the food will be 'blessed' in his intestines, therefore he will have no appetite for the מצה. That is why there is more need for caution by day than at night –

¹ See previous תוס' ד"ה לא.

² We know for sure that they are not חמץ. However since they were not guarded מצוה מצוה, one cannot fulfill the obligation of eating מצה with these בציקות של נכרים, although one is permitted to eat them (like potatoes).

³ He should eat a כזית of מצה מצוה after he fills himself with the בציקות של נכרים.

⁴ If one is prohibited from eating by day in order that he should have an appetite by night, so certainly one should not be permitted to eat at night, right before he eats the מצוה מצוה.

⁵ He knows how to pace himself and when to stop, since he is soon eating the מצוה מצוה. See 'Thinking it over'.

⁶ This seems to mean that (a while) after one eats he feels more satiated than right when he finishes eating, the food (so to speak) is 'blessed' in his intestines; giving him a stronger feeling of satiation.

anticipates a difficulty: תוספות

והא דדייק רבא לקמן (דף קז,ב) דחמרא גריר⁷ –

And regarding **this which רבא infers later that wine whets the appetite -**

דאי אמרת מיסעד סעיד בין הכוסות הללו⁸ אמאי ישתה -

‘For (says רבא) if you will say that wine satiates, why is one permitted to drink between these cups’; this proves (says רבא) that wine increases the appetite. However according to what תוספות stated previously there is seemingly no proof (as תוספות explains) -

אף על גב דבאותה סעודה נזהר מלאכול⁹ שובעו -

Even though תוספות just explained that in the same meal one is careful not to eat so that he is satiated, so what is the proof?!

responds: תוספות

אבל¹⁰ בשתיה אי אפשר להזהר -

(However) by drinking it is impossible to be careful, not to drink too much (as opposed to not eating too much) –

offers an alternate solution: תוספות

אי נמי מבין ראשון לשני דאיכא אגדתא והלל¹¹ דייק דדמי לסעודה אחרת:

Or you may also say that רבא inferred that wine is גריר from the fact that one may drink (even) between the first and second cups, where in between these two cups, there is the saying of the הגדה and reciting הלל, which makes it similar as if eating מצה after the second cup was another meal.

Summary

In one meal a person can pace himself not to overeat (but, not necessarily not to overdrink) in the same meal, however one may overeat if he thinks that by the next meal he will have an appetite. Making קידוש and eating מצה may be considered as two separate meals.

⁷ Therefore he would drink wine on ערב פסח so that he will have an appetite for the מצה.

⁸ One is permitted to drink between the first and second cup (also between the second and third cup). If however wine fills you up, we should be prohibited from drinking between the first and second cups, for otherwise he will not have any appetite to eat the מצת מצה (which is eaten after the second cup).

⁹ How can we prove that wine is גריר, perhaps wine is מיסעד סעיד (so one should not be permitted to drink on ערב פסח), and the reason we drink בין הכוסות הללו is because since it is in the same meal, one is careful not to be satiated.

¹⁰ The "אבל" deletes the word הגהות הב"ה.

¹¹ There is such a big break between the first and second cups of wine that we can consider it as two separate meals, where we say that one should not satiate himself, so if wine satiates how can we allow one to drink (right) after the first cup, for then he may drink too much, assuming that by the time he needs to eat the מצה after the second cup, he will not be full anymore (but in truth he would be satiated if wine was מיסעד סעיד), therefore since we allow him to drink that proves that wine merely whets the appetite but does not fill one up.

Thinking it over

How can we reconcile this which the גמרא states, ממלא אדם כריסו מהם, which indicates that he is completely satiated, with this which תוספות writes, ואינו אוכל כל שובעו, which means that he is not satiated.