

Why discuss the eves of *P'sochim*

מאי איריא ערבי פסחים -

Overview

The *משנה* taught that one may not eat on ערבי פסחים from למנחה onwards. The *גמרא* is asking why did the *תנא* restrict this prohibition to ערבי פסחים exclusively, when this prohibition of eating applies to all טובים וימים שבתות. Our *תוספות* explains why the *גמרא* could not have offered alternate answers.

תוספות asks:

ואם תאמר אמאי לא משני דתנא בפסח קאי כדמשני בפרק כל שעה (לעיל דף לז,א) גבי¹ פת עבה -
ערבי פסחים *גמרא* answer the reason he mentions exclusively is **because the תנא was involved in the laws of פסח, as the**
answered in פת עבה כל שעה regarding thick bread² -

תוספות answers:

ויש לומר משום דבפסח קאי אין לו להניח ערבי שבתות דתדירי בכל שבוע³ -
And one can say that just because the תנא is discussing פסח that does not justify
to omit ערבי שבתות which occur frequently every week -

תוספות offers an alternate solution:

אי נמי הכא דאיכא למיטעי ולמימר דדוקא נקט ערב פסח משום חיובא דמצה -
Or you may also say; here where there is room for error, for people may say that
the תנא specifically mentioned the prohibition for ע"פ only, because of the
obligation of eating מצה that night, therefore one may not eat למנחה, but it does not apply
to other (וערבי שבתות) יו"ט, therefore in order to avoid this misunderstanding -
לא הוה ליה למיתני⁴ ערב פסח⁵ -

¹ The *גמרא* there (on לז,ב) cited a *ברייתא* that one may not bake פת עבה (see footnote # 2)) on פסח. The *גמרא* asked since the reason for this prohibition is because it is an extra bother (טרחא), why discuss only פסח, when it applies to all טובים וימים. The *גמרא* answered the reason he mentions only פסח is because this תנא was in the midst of discussing פסח topics, therefore he mentioned that one may not bake פת עבה on פסח (even though it does apply to all טובים וימים). Why could not the *גמרא* give the same answer here; that the תנא mentions ע"פ specifically, since we are in the midst of discussing the laws of פסח.

² See the *גמרא* there that פת עבה means פת מרובה an overabundance of bread, which is not necessary for יו"ט.

³ *תוספות* is distinguishing between the omission of טובים וימים by פת עבה (which is not that frequent) so the reason of פסח sufficiently explains the omission, and our case of לא יאכל which applies every שבת, which is very common and frequent, therefore that fact that תנא בפסח קאי is insufficient reason to justify this omission.

⁴ In order to avoid a mistake in הלכה by the public, the תנא must be extra clear and not mince words.

⁵ However there by פת עבה (which means מרובה), there is seemingly no reason why one may have assumed that it is limited to פסח only, therefore תנא בפסח קאי is sufficient reason to omit יו"ט.

It should not have stated ע"פ, and not relied on (the excuse that) תנא בפסח קאי –

תוספות offers a similar case where there is a specific concern:

וכן בריש מקום שנהגו⁶ (לעיל דף נ,ב) איכא למיטעי⁷ -

And similarly in the beginning of שנהגו, one can make the mistake -

דדוקא בערב הפסח אסור לעשות מלאכה משום קרבן:

That it is specifically on ע"פ that one is prohibited from doing work because a

ע"פ is offered on ע"פ, therefore the גמרא there asks why mention this prohibition of work on ע"פ, when it applies every ע"ש וערב יו"ט.⁸

Summary

The answer of תנא בפסח קאי is not sufficient to exclude the ערבי שבתות, or alternately when there is room for error we cannot answer תנא בפסח קאי.

Thinking it over

It is apparent that תוספות cites גמרא from מקום שנהגו as a support to the אי נמי answer of תוספות (the concern of למיטעי⁹). However seemingly the גמרא in מקום שנהגו can equally support the first answer of תוספות that there is a difference between ערבי שבתות (which are תדיר) and ערבי יו"ט (which are not), so why does תוספות use this גמרא as a support for the second answer exclusively?!

⁶ The משנה there stated that it is forbidden to do מלאכה on פסח. The גמרא asked why mention only ע"פ when it (seemingly) applies to every ע"ש ועי"ט.

⁷ See 'Thinking it over'.

⁸ The גמרא there as well does not give the answer of תנא פסח קאי for the same reason he does not offer it here, since that reason does not justify the omission, because people may err in observing the הלכה.

⁹ See footnote # 7.