

Rav Nachmon challenged this

מתקין¹ לה רב נחמן -

Overview

ד"א ruled regarding the ביצאתא דמישן than one may not carry in it more than רב הונא, unless he filled the space between the planks with קני ואורבני, in which case it is permitted to carry in the entire boat even more than ד"א. רב נחמן challenged this ruling, for we should say גוד אחית תוס'. Our גוד אחית explains what the גוד אחית will accomplish.

רב"נ was asking:

למה לך כולי האי לימא גוד אחית מחיצתא מי לא תניא רבי יוסי ברבי יהודה אומר² וכולי -

Why do you need all these qualification to enable one to carry (more than ד"א) in this boat, did not we learn in a ברייתא that ריב"י rules, etc. -

אלמא רואין כאילו דופני הטרסקל יורדין עד עיקרו של קנה³ -

It is evident from the ruling of ריב"י that we perceive as if the walls of the basket descend until the bottom of the pole -

הכא נמי רואין כאילו דופני הספינה עקומין⁴ ומסבבין הנסרים ונמצאו הנסרים⁵ מחוברין:

So here too we should view it as if the walls of the boat are bent and surround the planks, so it will turn out that the planks are attached. One should be able to carry in the ביצאתא דמישן under all circumstances.

Summary

רב"נ asked that we should say גוד אחית to make the (separated) planks attached.

Thinking it over

תוספות states that we should say (גוד אחית) that the walls should extend inward (perpendicular to their vertical position).⁶ Where do we find גוד אחית in such a manner?⁷

¹ The מהרש"ל maintains that this is a continuation of the previous ד"ה הני (and not a new ד"ה) and so it appears in the תוס' הרא"ש.

² ריב"י ruled that if one placed a basket (which was דע"ד) above a pole (רה"ר י' טפחים) above the רה"ר, the basket is considered י"ט even though the walls of the basket are less than י"ט.

³ This is the rule of גוד אחית מחיצתא (pull down the partition).

⁴ It would seem that תוספות maintains that even though the walls of the ship are vertical, nevertheless we can say גוד אחית in a horizontal direction, so the vertical walls are pulled inward like the letter 'L'. This will enable the ship to have a 'virtual' bottom without any separation between the planks. See 'Thinking it over'. [There is no need for a 'regular' גוד אחית since according to תוס' the boat is דע"ד גבוה י' ורוחב דע"ד. See previous ד"ה הני תוס'.]

⁵ See previous ד"ה הני תוס' that the floor planks of the ביצאתא דמישן were separated from each other by more than ט"ט, so therefore it is considered a כרמלית. The גוד אחית should rectify this.

⁶ See footnote # 4.

⁷ See מלאכת שבת.