

Perhaps he will forget and go out

שמא ישכח ויצא –

OVERVIEW

The ערב שבת סמוך teaches that a tailor should not go out with his needle because perhaps 'he may forget and go out (with it)'. תוספות explains what is meant by, 'that we are concerned that he may forget'; what will he forget, that we do not allow him to go out with the needle לחשכה.

אליבא דרבא¹ דאמר לא גזרי גזירה לגזירה אין לפרש שמא ישכח המחט –

According to רבא, who maintains that the חכמים do not issue a decree for another decree, we cannot interpret 'that perhaps he will forget' is referring to the needle (that we are concerned that he will forget that he is carrying a needle, and therefore we prohibit him from carrying it לחשכה) -

דאפילו יצא ליכא איסור דאורייתא כדאיתא בפרק ב' דבבא קמא (דף כו, ב) –

For even if he will go out to the רה"ר with this 'forgotten' needle, there is no תורה prohibition, as it is stated in the second פרק of ב"ק מסכת, where the גמרא there writes

הכיר בה ושכחה לענין שבת פטור מלאכת מחשבת² אסרה תורה³ –

If he initially knew he was carrying a stone on his person and afterwards he forgot about it; regarding שבת (if he carried it on שבת) he is פטור, for the תורה forbade only a מלאכת מחשבת, and since he did not realize that he is carrying it, it is not a מלאכת מחשבת.

שמא ישכח explains what is meant by תוספות:

אלא שמא ישכח את המחט להצניעו עד שיהיה שבת⁴ –

¹ See the גמרא on the עמוד ב' where there is a מחלוקת between אביי and רבא regarding this issue. רבא maintains that the חכמים issue a decree forbidding something only out of concern that if not for this decree one may come to transgress an איסור דאורייתא; however if by not issuing this decree, there is only a possibility of transgressing an איסור דרבנן (which itself is only a גזירה), but not an איסור דאורייתא, the חכמים will not make a decree to 'preserve' another decree of the רבנן. See 'Thinking it over'.

² We derive the מלאכות of שבת from the מלאכות of the משכן. Regarding the מלאכות of the תורה (in עבדות אומנות as תרגום is rendered by the מלאכת מחשבת (שמות [ויקהל] לה, לג) uses term מלאכת מחשבת which is rendered by the מלאכה he is not aware that he is doing a מלאכה he is not מדאורייתא since it cannot be considered מלאכת מחשבת.

³ Therefore (according to רבא) there is (seemingly) no reason to prohibit the חייט from going out with his needle לחשכה, for even if he will forget about his needle and carry it on שבת he will not be transgressing an איסור דאורייתא.

⁴ See תוס' הרא"ש, מהר"ם, רש"ש etc. why תוספות found it necessary to say that he will forget the needle and then remember the needle and forget that it is שבת, when תוספות could say simply that he will forget that it is שבת (without ever forgetting the needle). See לישן הזהב who explains that if we are concerned that he will

But rather we are concerned **perhaps he will forget to put away the needle until it is already שבת** (and he still did not put it away) -

ולבסוף כשיזכור את המחט ישכח שהוא שבת ויצא⁵:

And later when he remembers the needle (on his person), **he will forget that it is שבת and will go out⁶** while carrying the needle knowingly in which case he will be transgressing an איסור דאורייתא.

SUMMARY

If we maintain לא גזרי גזירה לגזירה, the concern of שמא ישכח is (not that he may forget that he has a needle, but rather) that he may forget to put away the needle before שבת, and then (while he is aware of the needle) he will forget that it is שבת.

THINKING IT OVER

It appears from תוספות that according to אב"י⁷ (who maintains that גזרי גזירה) we can interpret שמא ישכח to mean that he will forget that he has a needle and will go out with it on שבת (even if there is no איסור דאורייתא, since לא גזרי גזירה לגזירה). However here since he is going out with it unknowingly, it is not something which the רבנן can prohibit (a גזירה) him from doing, in order that he should not go out when he is aware; for he is not aware that he is doing anything. Perhaps to prevent such a minor infraction (of מתעסק), even לא גזרי רבנן⁸ will agree that.

immediately forget that it is שבת (at the very beginning of שבת, for if he remembers שבת he will put away the needle), then there is no point in making this גזירה that he should not carry it ע"ש עם חשיכה since he is not aware that it is שבת. [It is illogical to assume that סמוך לחשיכה he is aware of שבת and immediately afterwards he forgets שבת.] Therefore תוספות assumes that everyone is aware when שבת is approaching; the concern is he will forget the needle, and later during שבת when he reminds himself of the needle he may forget שבת and carry it.

⁵ If we will permit him to have the מחט there will be the problem of an איסור דאורייתא as תוספות explains, therefore, we prohibit him from having the מחט with him, so that he will put it away קודם חשיכה.

⁶ According to תוספות interpretation we may also better understand the word ויצא in the משנה, which is seemingly superfluous (since it already said וכו' לא יצא החייט וכו' see פנ"י). However תוספות says that he will forget that he has a needle, and later when he is home he will forget that it is שבת, and will go out.

⁷ See footnote # 1.

⁸ See מנחת אריאל אות ה-ו and ח"י רע"א, שפ"א.