

רבה would kill them

רבה מקטע להו -

OVERVIEW

The גמרא mentions that רבה would kill the כנים. Our תוספות discusses whether he would kill them on the weekdays [only] or even on שבת.

מפרש רבינו יצחק בן אשר בחול¹ וקאי אדרב הונא דקאמר זהו כבודו אפילו בחול² –
The ריב"א explains that רבה would kill the כנים on a weekday (not שבת), and the ruling of רבה is mentioned in reference to the statement of רב הונא, who said, ‘the הלכה is מולל וזורק and that is his honorable way of disposing of them even on a weekday’ and in reference to the ruling of רב הונא the גמרא cites that רבה killed them on weekdays (for רבה maintains that even killing them is כבודו).

ריב"א disagrees with the תוספות:

ואנן סמכינן ארש"י דפירש בשבת³ וקיימא כבית הלל דשרו בסמוך:
And we depend on רש"י who explained that רבה killed them on שבת, for we maintain that the הלכה is according to ב"ה who permit killing a מאכולת (כנה) on שבת as is mentioned shortly.

SUMMARY

According to the ריב"א one is forbidden to kill a כנה on שבת, while רש"י and תוספות maintain that it is permitted.

THINKING IT OVER

How would the ריב"א explain⁴ that ב"ה maintains that one may kill a מאכולת (כנה) on שבת (and how is it that both the ת"ק and אבא שאול [seemingly] disagree with ב"ה)?⁵

¹ The ריב"א may argue that since both the ת"ק and אבא שאול maintain that we do not kill a כנה on שבת, therefore presumably רבה would agree with them. See ‘Thinking it over’.

² The ריב"א interprets רב הונא that even on weekdays one should only be מולל וזורק but not kill the כנה and certainly not on שבת, where there is an איסור; in conjunction with this the גמרא cites that רבה did kill them, but only on weekdays.

³ רש"י maintains that according to רב הונא one may kill a כנה (even) בשבת, but proper conduct (זהו כבודו) calls for one to refrain from killing them even on a weekday. The גמרא made this clear by citing the conduct of רבה that it is permissible to kill them.

⁴ See footnote # 1.

⁵ See (תוה"ר ר תוספות שאנ"ץ).