

על פתן ושמן משום יינן - On their bread and oil because of their wine

Overview

The גמרא includes the prohibition on the bread, oil and wine of נכרים as part of the י"ה דבר. The גמרא states that they prohibited the bread and oil of נכרים, so one should not come to drink the wine of נכרים.

asks: תוספות

הקשה רבינו יצחק בן אשר מאי שנא שהחמירו טפי ביין לאסור בהנאה מפת ושמן -

The ריב"א asked; why is there this difference that they were more strict by wine to forbid even deriving benefit from it, than by wine and oil, where they only prohibited eating/drinking it, but it is מותר בהנאה -

answers: תוספות

ותירץ מפני שהיין משמח אלהים ואנשים¹ והיו רגילין לנסכו אפילו שלא בפני עבודה זרה -

And the ריב"א answered because the 'wine gladdens G-d and men', and they were accustomed to pour it as a libation even not in the presence of the idol -

הואיל והוצרכו לאוסרו משום בנותיהם נתנו בו חכמים דין וחומר יין נסך ממש² -

So since it was necessary to prohibit wine, in order to prevent relationships with the gentile's daughters, so the חכמים put on their wine the same rule and strictness as actual libation wine, which is אסור בהנאה; they did this to סתם יינם -

כיון דפעמים היו מנסכין אותו אפילו שלא בפני עבודה זרה:

Since occasionally they would pour it as a libation even not in the presence of the ע"ז. All this does not apply to פתן ושמן.

Summary

Wine was forbidden because of בנותיהם and became אסור בהנאה since they are מנסך.

Thinking it over

The גמרא says they were גוזר on יינן, so obviously יינן is a bigger problem, that is why it is אסור בהנאה; what was the ריב"א's question?!

¹ This phrase is based on a פסוק in שופטים ט"ג, which reads, ותאמר להם הגפן הסדלתני את תירושי המשמח אלהים ואנשים. Becoming inebriated is prone to lead to sin. This was the initial cause of the גזירה on יינן.

² There are two issues with wine; they lead to promiscuity with בנותיהם, and oftentimes they would pour it לע"ז even if they were not drinking wine with נכרים, because of בנותיהם, once the חכמים were obliged to make this אסור, they extended it also to אסור בהנאה since it is possible that the יין סתם is actually יין נסך, therefore they made יין נסך just like אסור בהנאה.