

## The garlic and the unripe grapes and grains - השום והבוטר והמלילות -

### Overview

The cited משנה stated that if one crushed בוסר ומלילות on Friday, he may leave the weights on them so their juices will continue to ooze out (even) on שבת (according to ר' ישמעאל). Our גמרא reconciles our גמרא with a seemingly contradictory גמרא.

למאי דקאמר בריש חבית<sup>1</sup> (לקמן קמג,ב) מודים חכמים לרבי יהודה בשאר פירות<sup>2</sup> -

According to what שמואל said in the beginning of פרק חבית, 'the חכמים agree with ר"י by other fruits' -

ומייתי<sup>3</sup> מדתניא סוחטין בפגעין<sup>4</sup> ועוזרדין<sup>5</sup> אבל לא ברמונים<sup>6</sup> -

And the גמרא brings proof that מודים חכמים לר"י from the ברייתא that one may squeeze פגעין פרישים ועוזרדין but not pomegranates; תוספות explains -

צריך לומר דשום ובוטר יותר עשויין למשקין מפגעין ועוזרדין -

It will be necessary to say that שום ובוטר are used more for their juices than פגעין ועוזרדין, they are rather more like רמונים (which is אסור to squeeze), therefore there is an issue.

תוספות (seemingly) retracts:

ומיהו התם<sup>7</sup> מסיק דתרדין אף על גב דלאו בני סחיטה נינהו הואיל ואחשבינהו הוי ליה משקין -

However, the גמרא concludes there that spinach, even though it is not usually squeezed for its liquid, nevertheless since the juice is important for him<sup>8</sup> it is considered as משקין -

ולפי זה הא דקתני סוחטין בפגעים לאו סחיטה גמורה קאמר אלא מיתוק בעלמא:

So according to this concept of אחשבינהו, it will be necessary to say, this which the

<sup>1</sup> The משנה there stated that if the juices flowed out of fruits on their own on שבת, the חכמים prohibit drinking them on שבת (out of concern that he might squeeze them directly), and ר' יהודה maintains if the fruits were to be eaten, the juice is permitted (since he will never squeeze them for juice), however if the fruits were intended to be juiced, it is forbidden to drink these juices which flowed out on their own (like the חכמים).

<sup>2</sup> רבה אמר ר' יהודה אמר שמואל said that the חכמים agree with ר"י regarding all other fruits (except for olives and grapes) that if they are לאוכלין, the self-flowing juices are permitted (since they are not סחיטה בני).

<sup>3</sup> This is on קמד,א on the very bottom.

<sup>4</sup> The הגהות הב"ח amends this to read ופרישים ועוזרדין (instead of בפגעין ועוזרדין) [are plums, פגעין are פרישים], עוזרדין (some say) are crab apples.

<sup>5</sup> This proves that בשאר פירות רבנן agree with ר"י that there is no concern for סחיטה.

<sup>6</sup> It is more usual to squeeze juice out of רמונים than פגעין וכו'. In any event it seems that except for זיתים וענבים [and רמונים], there is no concern for סחיטה (in fact they may be squeezed directly on שבת), so why is there an issue here with שום ובוטר ומלילות (which were already crushed from before שבת); they should be permitted without question.

<sup>7</sup> קמד,ב.

<sup>8</sup> This is the explanation why רב נחמן there ruled that we may not squeeze רמונים, since אחשבינהו.

taught we may squeeze<sup>9</sup> plums, it does not mean<sup>10</sup> actual squeezing for its juice, but rather we are squeezing the plum to merely sweeten it.<sup>11</sup>

### Summary

One is permitted to squeeze [other] fruits (except olives, grapes and pomegranates), only למיתוק, but squeezing directly on שבת is problematic, since אחשבינהו.

### Thinking it over

Why is there a difference between squeezing למיתוק, which is permitted and squeezing for the juice, which is אסור (on שבת);<sup>12</sup> in both cases he is doing the same act of squeezing, and in both cases it is beneficial?

---

<sup>9</sup> are certainly more בני סחיטה than תרדין, so if by תרדין we say אחשבינהו, we certainly should say אחשבינהו by פגעים and it should be אסור to squeeze them for their juice (as it is by רמונים).

<sup>10</sup> Now that we say that סוחטין בפגעים is not real סחיטה but merely בעלמא מיתוק, we can understand why there is an issue of real סחיטה by שום ובוסר (especially since אחשבינהו), but not by פגעים וכו'. We do not need to say anymore, as תוס' previously said, that שום ובוסר are ועורדין מפגעים למשקין. Rather עשויין למשקין ועורדין מפגעים (therefore it is permitted), however by שום וכו' it is for their juice (therefore there is an issue).

<sup>11</sup> And therefore the little bit of juice which is squeezed out is also מותר. Nonetheless even though it is for מיתוק, it is still prohibited by רמונים. See קמ"ד, ב ד"ה כרב חסדא רש"י there.

<sup>12</sup> What exactly is the מלאכה of סחיטה?