And one saved with four and five vessels מציל בארבע וחמש מאני-

Overview

The גמרא related that there were two students and one of them used one vessel to save food and drink from a fire and the other used four and five vessels to save food from the fire. The גמרא said that these two students had the same argument between them as the argument between רבה בר זבדא and רב הונא. There is a dispute between and תוספות as to the meaning of מציל בארבע וחמש מאני.

פירש בקונטרס² ומקפלן כולן בתוך כלי אחד³ ונושאן בבת אחת -רש"י explained that the one who was מציל בד' וה' מאני, folded everything into one vessel and carried everything out at one time –

תוספות disagrees with "רש"י:

ואין נראה לרבינו תם דבפרק כל כתבי (לקמן דף קכ,א.) לא פליגי אמוראי בהא -And this does not seem correct to the ר"ת, for in אמוראים the אמוראים (namely מקפלן כולן בתוך כלי אחד and רבה בת do not argue in this case where he was - מקפלן כולן בתוך כלי דבעיא היא ופשיט דכבא להציל⁴ דמי ושרי לכולי עלמא - דבעיא

For this case (of מקפלן בכלי אחד) was a query there (posed by רב הונא בריה דרב יהושע) and it was resolved that this case of מקפלן כולן וכו' is like a case of בא להציל and it is permitted according to everyone.6

תוספות offers his explanation:

ומפרש רבינו תם דחד מציל בחד מנא אפילו מאה סעודות -And the ה"ה explained that one student saved in one vessel, even one hundred

 2 בד"ה וחד.

רב הונא 1 maintains that (when saving from a fire) if one is א להציל (he is taking out one basket) he may take as much food as there is in the basket, however if he is לקפל (he is taking it out in many baskets) he may only take out food for three meals. רבה בר זבדא maintains that (even) by בא לקפל if he is taking it out to the same חצר (not to a different חצר,), he may take out as much as he can. There is no dispute by בבא להציל; all agree that he can take out as much as he can.

³ In our רש"י the text reads כלי גדול (not כלי אחד).

בא להציל ⁴ means he is 'coming to save' a basket of food. Everyone agrees that he may take out the entire basket even if it contains more than three meals worth. The גמרא there resolved the query that if he kept taking things and placing it into one vessel, he may take out this vessel even if he made many trips to gather items to be placed into this one vessel, for it is considered כבא להציל.

⁵ How can רש", say that one student took many vessels and placed them into one vessel, and by doing this he followed the opinion of רבה בר זבדא, when all agree that this is permitted. See 'Thinking it over'.

⁶ See footnote # 1 that by בא there is no מהלוקת and the מרא ruled that if he was בא that it is like מרא מרא מהלוקת להציל.

meals -

- אבל בארבע וחמש מאני כגון להציל ולחזור ולהציל אפילו באותו חצר לא But with four or five vessels, for instance to save and go back to save more, even to the same חצר, this student would not do it (like רב הונא) -

וחד מציל בד' וה' מאני לאותו חצר –

- (רבה בר זבדא (like אדר (like רבה בר זבדא) **הצר** (like רבה בר זבדא ורב הונא:

And that consists the dispute between רבה בר זבדא and רב הונא there in פרק כל כתבי.

Summary

According to רש"י the student who saved with four or five vessels, placed them into one vessel before removing it, while תוספות maintains that all agree that this is permitted, but rather he took them out with four/five vessels to אותו הצר (which אותו הצר prohibits and רבה בר ובדא permits).

Thinking it over

explains the query of פרק טליתו וקיפל והניח (which חוספות cites here), is in a case where והניח מהו וחזר והביא והניח אוכלין והניח וחזר והביא והניח מהו which is not the same as here where he took four/five vessels and placed them inside a large vessel. This would seemingly answer חוספות question on "רש"י Why would there by a difference whether he kept on bringing food and placing them in one vessel, which is permitted (and he may take as much as he can), and bringing vessels of food and placing them in one vessel, which may not be permitted (according to רב הונא)?¹⁰

⁷ It is prohibited even if there was an עירובי חציר between the בית and this חצר (because of טירחא יתירא).

⁸ See footnote # 1.

⁹ See footnote # 5.

¹⁰ See לשון הזהב.