

וחד מציל בארבע וחמש מאני - And one saved with four and five vessels

Overview

The גמרא related that there were two students and one of them used one vessel to save food and drink from a fire and the other used four and five vessels to save food from the fire. The גמרא said that these two students had the same argument between them as the argument between רבה בר זבדא and רב הונא.¹ There is a dispute between רש"י and תוספות as to the meaning of מציל בארבע וחמש מאני.

פירש בקונטרס² ומקפלן כולן בתוך כלי אחד³ ונושאן בבת אחת -

explained that the one who was מאני וה' מציל בד' ו' **folded everything into one vessel and carried everything out at one time** –

רש"י disagrees with תוספות:

ואין נראה לרבינו תם דבפרק כל כתבי (לקמן דף קב,א.) לא פליגי אמוראי בהא -

(namely אמוראים the פרק כל כתבי ר"ת, for in this case where he was אחד כלי אחד - מקפלן כולן בתוך כלי אחד) **do not argue in this** case where he was אחד כלי אחד - דבעיא היא ופשיט דכבא להציל⁴ דמי ושרי לכולי עלמא⁵ -

For this case (of מקפלן בכלי אחד) was a query there (posed by יהושע דרב הונא בריה דרב יהושע) **and it was resolved that this case of מקפלן כולן וכו' is like a case of בא להציל and it is permitted according to everyone.**⁶

תוספות offers his explanation:

ומפרש רבינו תם דחד מציל בחד מנא אפילו מאה סעודות -

And the ר"ת explained that one student saved in one vessel, even one hundred

¹ רב הונא maintains that (when saving from a fire) if one is בא להציל (he is taking out one basket) he may take as much food as there is in the basket, however if he is בא לקפל (he is taking it out in many baskets) he may only take out food for three meals. רבה בר זבדא maintains that (even) by לקפל if he is taking it out to the same הצר (not to a different הצר), he may take out as much as he can. There is no dispute by להציל; all agree that he can take out as much as he can.

² בד"ה וחד.

³ In our רש"י the text reads כלי גדול (not כלי אחד).

⁴ בא להציל means he is 'coming to save' a basket of food. Everyone agrees that he may take out the entire basket even if it contains more than three meals worth. The גמרא there resolved the query that if he kept taking things and placing it into one vessel, he may take out this vessel even if he made many trips to gather items to be placed into this one vessel, for it is considered להציל.

⁵ How can רש"י say that one student took many vessels and placed them into one vessel, and by doing this he followed the opinion of רבה בר זבדא, when all agree that this is permitted. See 'Thinking it over'.

⁶ See footnote # 1 that by בא להציל there is no מחלוקת and the גמרא ruled that if he was בכלי אחד that it is like בא להציל.

