

Overview

The גמרא asks why the עני\ בעה"ב is חייב; since either the הנחה or עקירה was from a hand or on a hand, as is stated in the משנה, there should be no חיוב, since a place of טפחים ד' על ד' is required for an עקירה or הנחה. תוספות will explain why the גמרא assumes that a place of ד' על ד' is required for an עקירה or הנחה.

תוספות gives two explanations: 1) That we derive it from the משכן, 2) that we learn it from a פסוק.

But we require an עקירה and a הנחה from a place that is four טפחים by four טפחים.¹

unasked question is: why does the גמרא assume that a place of ד' על ד' טפחים is required for an עקירה and a הנחה?

תוספות replies:

says רבינו תם – אומר ר"ת

that since it is not customary to place an article on a place that is less than four טפחים (because it may fall, etc.),

and therefore presumably that is the way that it was in the משכן, that they placed objects only on a place that is ד' על ד', and since we learn out all מלאכות from מלאכת המשכן, therefore an עקירה or a הנחה has to be on a ד' מקום ד' just as it was in the משכן.

and furthermore says רבינו יצחק, another reason why the גמרא assumes that we need a ד' על ד' מקום, is that we learn it out from a פסוק.

אל יצא איש ממקומו פסוק – **that the דאל יצא איש ממקומו** which literally means “no man leave *his* place,”²

משמע נמי דקאי אחפץ - **also means that we are referring** (with the word **ממקומו**) **to the object**, not only to the person, as in the literal meaning.

כלומר ממקומו של חפץ – **as if to say that the word ממקומו**, means **from the place of the object**,

מס' עירובין פסוק in פסוק גמרא – **as the דרשינן בעירובין (פ"א יז,ב)** **אל יצא** – **that the words of the "אל יצא"** which literally mean “no one should *leave* from *his* place”, should be understood as if it was written **אל יוציא, do not take out** an object from *its* place,

אף על גב דפשטיה דקרא – **even though that the simple reading of the פסוק**

קאי על מקומו של אדם – **the word ממקומו refers to the place of the man,**

¹ A טפח is approximately 3 to 4 inches

² The פסוק "אל יצא איש ממקומו" may be understood in its literal meaning that “no man shall *leave his* place” meaning, as תוספות will say, that he should not leave his ד' אמות (if he traveled a שבת תחום, he may only stay in the ד' אמות at the end of the תחום). See ד"ה יציאות (הב') for a different reading of the פסוק.

אמות – דהיינו ד' אמות – which is four³, i.e. The simple meaning of the פסוק is that no man should leave his place of אמות ד' (if he traveled a שבת, he is limited to his ד' אמות)

nevertheless it also means the place of the object, i.e. No man shall remove or carry out an object from its place to another רשות.

ד' על – and it is not a proper place if it is **less than** ד' ואין מקום חשוב פחות מד'. I.e. the תורה forbids us to remove an object from *its place*, referring to the resting place of the object as a מקום, meaning a place that is fitting to be called a significant place, and less than ד' על ד' is not considered a significant place.

Summary

The two sources from where we know that a מקום ד' על ד' טפחים is required for a עקירה והנחה are:

- 1) presumably no one places an object on a space less than ד' (because it is not safe), therefore we can reasonably assume that in the משכן this was the case as well, and since all הוצאה והכנסה including מלאכת שבת are learnt from the משכן, they have to be done in the same manner as they were done in the משכן, namely עקירה והנחה מעל גבי מקום ד' על ד'.
- 2) There is a פסוק which says אל יצא איש ממקומו, which according to the גמרא may be understood to mean that one should not carry out something from *its place*, since the פסוק refers to the resting place of the object with the word ממקומו (from its *place*), the פסוק is telling us that it requires a formal and significant resting place, and less than ד' is not a formal and significant resting place.

Thinking it over

1. How does רש"י explain this issue, from where do we know that a מקום ד' is required?
2. What may be the relative stronger and weaker points in the פשט, of רש"י, פשט, or ר"ת, ור"י?
3. We learnt before in (ב, א ד"ה פשט) תוספות, that there was הוצאה והכנסה in the משכן, when the קרשים were loaded and unloaded from the ground to the משכן (and vice versa). Now both the ground and the עגלה is a מקום ד', so why does תוס' say that we presume that a מקום ד' was used in the משכן for עקירה והנחה, when we *know for sure* that it was so?
4. The 2 sources of תוס' for a מקום ד' are 1) the משכן, 2) the פסוק אל יצא. Can we correlate these two points with the פשט ב, א ד"ה פשט, תוס'?

³ An אמה is 6 טפחים, or approximately 18 to 24 inches, ד' אמות would be about 6 to 8 feet