

And what is the difference

ומאי שנא –

OVERVIEW

לחצר taught that one is permitted to return the hand חצר, but not לחצר אותה חצר; to which רבא asked him, 'what is the difference' between חצר and חצר; to which רבא asked him, 'what is the difference' between חצר and חצר; to which רבא asked him, 'what is the difference' between חצר and חצר. תוספות explains that רבא asked his question only because he limited the concept of חצר.

בזו כנגד זו איירי בדיוטא אחת שנא ושנא –

We are discussing a case where the two חצרים (the חצר and the חצר) are one opposite the other (on two sides of the רה"ר) therefore רבא asked מ"ש (if it is חצר or חצר), for if the two חצרים were on the same side of the רה"ר, the two case are indeed different, and רבא would not have asked מ"ש, for it is understood why לחצר חצר it is אסור –

דאיכא איסור חיוב חטאת דמושיט¹ מרשות היחיד לרשות הרבים –
For if he transfers it from the רה"ר to a חצר חצר בדיוטא אחת there is the prohibition of a חיוב חטאת for the תולדה of רה"ר לרה"י דרך רה"ר.

מ"ש רבא could ask where an alternate case offers תוספות:

אי נמי בדיוטא אחת וכגון שאין מפסיק שם רשות הרבים:

Or you may even say that both חצרים were בדיוטא אחת, where for instance there was no רה"ר separating them, so there is no possibility of איסור מושיט, therefore רבא asked מ"ש.

SUMMARY

רבא asked מ"ש because he assumed that the two חצרים were on two sides of a רה"ר or there was no רה"ר between them; however if they were בדיוטא אחת there is the issue of רה"ר לרה"י דרך רה"ר.

THINKING IT OVER

1. What can we infer from the fact that תוספות refers to this מושיט as 'איסור' –
² חיוב חטאת דמושיט, and not חיוב חטאת דמושיט?

2. If one extends his hand into a כרמלית can he return it לחצר חצר?³

¹ See פשט (TIE footnote # 10 [and the 'Overview' to (הא') תוד"ה אבל (הא')]).

² See ישראלי בד"ה ברש"י.

³ See מנחת איש.