

והא בעינן עקירה והנחה מעל מקום ד' –

טפחים¹ But we require an עקירה and a הנחה from a place that is four

OVERVIEW

The גמרא asks why the ענין בעה"ב is חייב; since either the עקירה or הנחה was from a hand or on a hand, as is stated in the משנה, there should be no חיוב, since a place of טפחים is required for an עקירה or הנחה. תוספות will explain why the גמרא assumes that a place of ד' על ד' is required for an עקירה or הנחה.

ד' על ד' טפחים anticipates the following question: why does the גמרא assume that a place of ד' על ד' is required for an עקירה and a הנחה? תוספות replies:

אומר רבינו תם דאין רגילות להניח החפץ בפחות מד'² -

תם says – That since it is not customary to place an article on a place that is less than four טפחים (because it may fall, etc.), -

וכן היה מסתמא במשכן -

and therefore presumably that is the way that it was in the משכן, that they placed objects only on a place that is ד' על ד', and since we derive all מלאכות from מלאכת המשכן, therefore an עקירה or a הנחה has to be on a ד' על ד' just as it was in the משכן .

תוספות offers an alternate explanation why a ד' על ד' is required:

ועוד אומר רבינו יצחק דאל יצא איש ממקומו -

And furthermore says the ר"י, that the פסוק of איש ממקומו אל יצא איש ממקומו which literally means “no man leave *his* place”,³ -

משמע נמי דקאי אחפץ -

also means that we are referring (with the word ממקומו) to the object, not only to the person, as in the literal meaning –

כלומר ממקומו של חפץ -

as if to say that the word ממקומו, means from the place of the object –

דרשינן בעירובין (פרק א' יז, ב)⁴ דאל יצא אל יוציא -

as the גמרא interprets this פסוק in עירובין מס' that the words of the "אל יצא",

¹ A טפח is approximately 3 to 4 inches

² See 'Thinking it over # 4.

³ The פסוק of איש ממקומו אל יצא איש ממקומו may be understood in its literal meaning that “no man shall leave *his* place” meaning, as תוספות will say, that he should not leave his ד' אמות (if he traveled a שבת תחום, he must remain in the ד' אמות at the end of the תחום). See (הב') ד"ה יציאות for a different reading of the פסוק.

⁴ See (and TIE (הב') מהר"ם footnote # 3). (הב') ד"ה יציאות

which literally mean “no one should leave from *his* place”, should be understood as if it was written **אל יציא, do not take out** an object from *its* place,

אף על גב דפשטיה דקרא קאי על מקומו של אדם דהיינו ד' אמות -

Even though that in the simple reading of the פסוק, the word ממקומו refers to the place of the man, which is four אמות,⁵ i.e. The simple meaning of the פסוק is that no man should leave his place of ד' אמות (if he traveled a שבת תחום, he is limited to his ד' אמות) –

מכל מקום משמע נמי מקום החפץ ואין מקום חשוב פחות מד' -

Nevertheless it also means the place of the object, i.e. No man shall remove or carry out an object from its place to another רשות; and it cannot be considered a proper place if it is less than טפחים ד' על ד'. I.e. the תורה forbids us to remove an object from *its place*, referring to the resting place of the object as a מקום, meaning a place that is fitting to be called a significant place, and less than ד' על ד' is not considered a significant place.

SUMMARY

The two sources from where we know that a מקום ד' על ד' טפחים is required for עקירה are:

- 1) Presumably no one places an object on a space less than ד' (because it is not safe), therefore we can reasonably assume that in the משכן this was the case as well, and since all מלאכת שבת including הוצאה והכנסה are learnt from the משכן, they have to be done in the same manner as they were done in the משכן, namely עקירה והנחה מעל גבי מקום ד' על ד'.
- 2) There is a פסוק which says אל יצא איש ממקומו, which according to the גמרא may be understood to mean that one should not carry out something from *its place*, since the פסוק refers to the resting place of the object with the word ממקומו (from its place), the פסוק is telling us that it requires a formal and significant resting place, and less than ד' is not a formal and significant resting place.

THINKING IT OVER

1. What may be the relative advantages of the various פשטים of ר"ת, רש"י, and the ר"י, why a מקום ד' is required for עקירה והנחה?
2. We learnt before in (ב, א ד"ה פשט), תוספות, that there was הוצאה והכנסה in the משכן, when the עגלות loaded and unloaded the קרשים from the ground to the ground (and

⁵ An אמה is 6 טפחים, or approximately 18 to 24 inches, ד' אמות would be about 6 to 8 feet

vice versa). Now both the ground and the עגלה is a 'מקום ד', so why does 'תוס' say that we presume that a 'מקום ד' was used in the משכן for עקירה והנחה, when we *know for sure* that it was so?

3. The two sources of 'תוס' for a 'מקום ד' are 1) the משכן, 2) the פסוק אל יצא. Can we correlate these two points with the פשט ב, א ד"ה פשט?⁶

4. תוספות first explanation (by the ר"ת) is that it is usual to place an object on a 'מקום ד' and presumably that is the way it was done in the משכן.⁷ Seemingly it is usual to place objects in a hand (and this is this [also] they way it was in the משכן⁸). The גמרא should have answered immediately that ידו של אדם is חשובה for a מקום עקירה והנחה!⁹

⁶ See מנחת איש and מתק שפתים

⁷ See footnote # 2.

⁸ See ונותנין ליד עושי המלאכה (TIE footnote # 7) that ב, ד"ה ודלימא.

⁹ See שפ"א.