

And why did they call it a complete etc., For you may have said

Overview

question is, that by adding the word **גמורה**, the **תנא** of the **ברייתא** is being counterproductive. Instead of teaching us that the **רה"י** of **רה"י** is no **רה"י** at all, even **לחומרא**, it seems to teach us instead that it may not be a **רה"י** **רה"י** מדאורייתא, to be permitted to carry there, but it is considered a **רה"י** **רה"י** מדאורייתא that by throwing an object there from the **רה"ר** one will be **חייב**.

The ר"י says that the expression “this is a complete רה"י

indicates to the contrary, not the way the **גמרא** is interpreting it; that only the **רה"י** of the **ברייתא** is a valid **רה"י**, but the **רה"י** of **רה"י** is not a **רה"י** at all even **לחומרא**, meaning that if someone throws something from the **רה"ר** into the **רה"י** of **רה"י** he will be **פטור**, but rather the expression –

“this is a complete רה"י”, indicates that only the **רה"י** of the **ברייתא** is a **complete רה"י** even to the extent that one is permitted to carry in it,

however this one – the **רה"י** of **רה"י** which we are excluding by the expression **“זו היא רה"י גמורה”**, **is not a complete רה"י**, to the extent that one may carry there as well,

however it is a partial רה"י, to the extent that if someone throws an object from a **רה"ר** into the **רה"י** of **רה"י** he will be **חייב** **מדהאורייתא**.

albeit with difficulty – **explains the interpretation of the word גמורה (complete).**²

¹ In his glosses the **ח"ב** changes the reading of the text; deleting **“לפי הגמרא”**, and inserting instead **לפירוש** **גמורה**. The translation here will follow the gloss of the **ח"ב**.

² See **רש"י ד"ה קמ"ל גמורה**, that the word **גמורה** does not qualify or modify to the term **רה"י**, that it should mean **“this is a complete רה"י”** but rather the word **גמורה** is to be understood as being an explanation or reason for the **רה"י**. The phrase **זהו היא רה"י גמורה** is to be understood; **“this is a רה"י** – since the **מחיצות** are **completed** (or **נגמרו**, from all sides)”. However where the **מחיצות** are not completed, as in the case of **ב' בתים** **וכו'**, it is not a **רה"י** at all, even **לחומרא**.