

אף על גב דאיכא דדמיה לה חשיב¹ -

Even though there are those that are similar to it; he mentions [it]

OVERVIEW

The גמרא asked why does the משנה mention זורה (winnowing), בורר (selecting), and מרקד (sifting) as separate אבות,² since they seem to be similar to each other. אביי answered that whatever מלאכה was in the משכן, is enumerated in the משנה as a separate מלאכה, even though there are others which are similar to it. תוספות distinguishes these three אבות מלאכות from other types of תולדות, which are not enumerated as אבות מלאכות.

תוספות responds to an anticipated question:

והא דלא חשיב שובט ומדקדק³ לפי שהם לגמרי בכלל מיסך ואורג⁴ -

And the reason the משנה did not enumerate שובט ומדקדק as אבות מלאכות⁵, because they are completely included within מיסך ואורג; we cannot distinguish between them -

תוספות responds to a similar question:

ולא חשיב נמי מנפץ⁶ אף על גב שבמשכן היו מנפצין פשתן לעשות יריעות⁷ ושאר דברים -

And the משנה also does not mention מנפץ פשתן as one of the אבות מלאכות, even though they were מנפץ פשתן in the משכן to make the יריעות and other items -

משום דהיינו דש ממש אלא שזה בתבואה וזה בפשתן אבל זורה ובורר ומרקד הם שלשה דברים: Because דש (threshing), except that דש is done to grain

¹ The הגהות הב"ח amends this to read חשיב לה (instead of חשיב).

² See footnote # 9.

³ See the גמרא on עה,ב where ר' יהודה added שובט ומדקדק to the אבות מלאכות; the חכמים responded that שובט הוא בכלל מיסך ואורג (which [מיסך ואורג] are already mentioned in the משנה). תוספות has no need to prove that שובט ומדקדק were in the משכן since by any weaving process there is by definition שובט ומדקדק as well as מיסך ואורג.

⁴ In the weaving process there are the vertical threads (שתי) and the horizontal thread (ערב) which is interwoven between the שתי threads. The שתי threads are first wrapped around a roller and extend from it. This process of preparing the שתי is called מיסך. The process of straightening the שתי threads (so they do not tangle) is called שובט; it is included in מיסך for it is an integral part of the process of setting up the שתי. The insertion of the ערב thread between the שתי threads is the מלאכה אורג. Making sure that the weave is not too tight is called מדקדק; this is an integral part of the weaving process. See רש"י עה,ב בד"ה שובט מדקדק וכו'.

⁵ These אבות מלאכות took place in the משכן, so they should be enumerated separately (as ר' יהודה maintains). See 'Thinking it over'.

⁶ The משנה does state מנפצו; however that is regarding wool; תוספות is asking why not mention מנפץ פשתן which is a different type of work. By wool the ניפוך (banging) is to separate the strands of wool from each other, by flax the ניפוך is to separate the flax seeds from the stalk.

⁷ The יריעות (coverings of the משכן) were made from שש משור which is spun linen (made from flax).

and מנפץ is done to flax;⁸ however זורה ובורר ומרקד are three distinct separate things.⁹

SUMMARY

The משנה will enumerate similar but distinct מלאכות; however it will not enumerate מלאכות which are totally included in other מלאכות due to their complete similarity.

THINKING IT OVER

תוספות asks why are מלאכות ומדקדק, שובט and מוסף, not enumerated as מלאכות.¹⁰ However, this issue is raised in the גמרא later between ר"י and the רבנן where they answered him that מוסף is adding.¹¹ What is מוסף adding?¹²

⁸ Therefore it cannot be considered a separate מלאכה from דש.

⁹ Winnowing (זורה) is separating the grain from the chaff by the wind; selecting (בורר) is separating the grain from impurities by hand, and sifting (מרקד) is purifying the flour with a sieve. The תוס' הרא"ש adds; שאין האחד יכול לברור מה שחבירו בורר.

¹⁰ See footnote # 5.

¹¹ See footnote # 3.

¹² See שבת של מי.