

For if he would want he could take it out

דאי בעי מפקע ליה -

Overview

The גמרא is trying to prove that אגד כלי לא שמיא אגד¹, for if שמיא אגד¹, why is the ruling that in a case where one stole a purse on שבת and dragged it from the רה"י to the רה"ר he is פטור from paying since he is חייב מיתה for חילול שבת of הוצאה simultaneously with the איסור גניבה. The גמרא asks even if we are discussing that he dragged it by the bottom of the purse (so he cannot take out the money from the opening), nevertheless he can tear the seam and take out the money, so the איסור גניבה precedes the איסור שבת. Our תוספות clarifies this question.

נראה לרבינו יצחק שניסין שלהם לא היו תפורות בחוזק כמו שלנו -

It is the view of the ר"י that their purses in those days were not sewn as strongly as our purses are -

ולהכי פריך ממקום התפירה ולא ממקום אחר:

So therefore the גמרא asks that he tear the purse from the place of the seam (which is not so strong), but not from any other place, which is more difficult to tear.

Summary

It is easier to tear the seam than to tear the purse (especially in those days).

Thinking it over

Is תוספות explaining that the גמרא asks ממקום תפירה and not from anywhere else, because practically it is very difficult to do so (however the real question is that he can tear the purse from anyplace), or is תוספות telling us that if it is that difficult, then there would be no question (for he is certainly not קונה)?

¹ The rule is that one is not liable for מרשות לרשות until the entire item is placed in the new רשות. The issue of אגד כלי is regarding one who partially removes a utensil with items inside. Some of these items are found in the new רשות, while the כלי is still in the process of being transferred between the two רשויות. If we maintain אגד כלי שמיא אגד, there is no חיוב for these items which were taken out in the כלי, until the entire כלי is taken out. However if we say לא שמיא אגד, one is חייב for the items in the כלי, which were taken out. The word אגד means binding or attached. אגד כלי means the fact that the items are in the כלי, binds them to the כלי and they are part of it.