

## One who carries out with his mouth, etc.

## המוציא בפיו כולי -

### Overview

The משנה states that one who carries out an item in his mouth is פטור, since he did not carry it in a normal manner. תוספות reconciles our משנה with a seemingly contradictory משנה.

anticipates a difficulty: תוספות

והא דתנן באמרו לו<sup>1</sup> (כריתות ד' יג,ב) אם היתה שבת והוציאו בפיו חייב -

And this which רבי מאיר stated in a משנה in פרק אמרו לו, 'if it was שבת and he carried it out in his mouth, he is חייב' This concludes the citation. This contradicts the ruling of our משנה, which states פטור -

responds: תוספות

הני מילי אוכלים שדרכן להוציאן בפיו בשעת אכילה:

When does this apply that one is חייב for הוצאה בפה, only by food, for it is customary to carry out food in the mouth while eating, however if one carries out non-edible items in his mouth he is פטור as our משנה states.

### Summary

For carrying food in one's mouth while eating, one is חייב, otherwise one is פטור.

### Thinking it over

1. What would be the ruling if one carries out food in his mouth with the intention of giving it to someone else outside (but he is not eating it), will he be חייב or פטור?

2. Why should he be חייב if he is eating it, there was no עקירה והנחה on a 'על ד' מקום ד' על ד'<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> The משנה there is saying that it is possible for a person to eat one כזית of forbidden food and transgress many עבירות. חילול שבת adds an additional עבירה; if he carried out the food he was eating, he is also חייב for שבת.

<sup>2</sup> This is the גירסא of the שיטה מקובצת and the הגהות הב"ח there. In the משנה it (merely) states, והוציאו חייב.

<sup>3</sup> See שבת של מי.