

This one cannot and - זה אינו יכול וזה אינו יכול רבי מאיר ורבי יהודה מחייבין - this one cannot; *Rabi Mayer and Rabi Yehudoh* hold him liable

Overview

In a case where each individual alone could not have done the מלאכה (for instance it was a heavy object which neither could carry out to the ר"ה), but together they were able to do the מלאכה, they are both חייב (קרבת חטאת) ¹ according to ר"מ ור"י. Our Gemara explains why our Gemara does not contradict another Gemara.

מה שהקשה רבינו יצחק בן אשר אמאי לא אמרינן חטאת אחד אמר רחמנא -

This which the ריב"א asked; why do we not say that the Merciful one said to bring one חטאת קרבן, if one desecrates the שבת -

ולא שנים ושלושה כדאמר גבי כופר² מפורש³ בפרק ד' וה' (בבא קמא דף מ,א דיבור המתחיל כופר):

But not two or three חטאות, as the Gemara states regarding כופר; the answer was explained in 'פרק ד' וה'.

Summary

The question of two חטאות was resolved in ב"ק.

Thinking it over

1. Why does תוספות assume (in ב"ק) that each one brings a separate חטאת (perhaps they bring one in partnership), and why does תוספות assume that they each receive חטאת if done במזיד (since it is יכול וכו'?)

2. The תורה does not state explicitly that for חילול שבת one brings one חטאת, however it does state specifically that for a שור המועד there is one כופר; how can the ריב"א compare the two cases?!

¹ See the תוספות cited here where תוספות writes חייב חטאת.

² The rule is if a שור המועד (who killed three people) kills a fourth person, the ox is stoned to death and the owner must pay כופר (ransom money). The Gemara there discusses that if the שור was owned by partners; they can't each pay the full כופר, for the תורה wrote one כופר, but not two כופרין. עיי"ש. The same question applies here, seemingly there is one חייב קרבנות חטאת for one desecration of the שבת; not two חטאות.

³ We cite the תוספות there; ועוד חטאת דלגבוה אין להקפיד אי מביאין. By שבת if they would both do it knowingly they would each be חייב חטאת, therefore by שוגג they are each חייב חטאת (see 'Thinking it over'). Secondly by שבת the חטאת goes to Hashem so there is no concern if two חטאות are brought, but regarding כופר, since it goes to the deceased's family, why should they profit because the ox was owned by two.