

חד למעוטי זה עוקר וזה מניח –

One, to exclude, this one lifts and this one puts down

Overview

The גמרא states that one of the limiting words (נפש or אחת) excludes a case of זה עוקר וזה מניח that they are both פטור. Our תוספות explains why this exclusion of doing a partial הוצאה והכנסה is limited to מלאכה.

תוספות replies to an anticipated question:

וזה כתב אות אחת ובא חבירו וכתב אות שניה לא איצטריך קרא¹ אלא אהוצאה -

And regarding the case where this one wrote one letter and his friend came and wrote a second letter (in which case both are פטור), **a פסוק is not necessary** to teach us that they are פטור; we require a פסוק **only for הוצאה** in a case of זה עוקר וזה מניח -

דהוה אמינא אהכנסה ואהוצאה הוא דקפיד רחמנא וליחייב אפילו בלא² הנחה:

For I would have thought that the Merciful one is particular only for carrying in or carrying out, so one should be liable even if he did not put it down, as long as it was transferred from one רשות to the other.

Summary

By הוצאה there is more reason to assume that whoever transfers לרשות should be חייב than in case where one did just a שיעור.

Thinking it over

תוספות previously stated³ that it cannot be that the עוקר should be חייב, since he did not do the מלאכה. How can we reconcile both תוספות?!⁴

¹ One is not חייב for כתיבה בשבת unless he writes two אותיות. We do not find that a פסוק is needed to teach us that for writing one אות one is פטור, even if he wrote the second אות (only), because it is obvious that the מלאכה is writing two אותיות, and writing one אות is a שיעור, where there is no חטאת. The question is why do we need a פסוק for זה עוקר וזה מניח; seemingly neither did the מלאכה, why should either of them be חייב?! (See שפת אמת.)

² Seemingly תוספות means to say that we would have thought if the עוקר did the transfer לרשות he should be חייב even if he did not make the הנחה (only the מניח did), since he did the main מלאכה which is transferring from one רשות to another רשות, and there was an עקירה והוצאה by the עוקר and a הנחה by the מניח. [It is self-understood that this is different from 'וכי' כותב אות א' and 'וכי' כותב אות ב' for there, neither one did the main מלאכה.] See however 'Thinking it over'.

³ See תוספות there שניהם ג,א ד"ה שניהם, who writes; הראשון, אלא אשני קא פריך שיתחייב לפי שעל ידו נגמרה המלאכה.

⁴ See שו"ת אפיקי ים (ח"ב סי' ז' ענף ח') and חתם סופר.