

אמר מר זה יכול וזה אינו יכול -

The master said; this one can and this one cannot

Overview

The גמרא previously cited a ברייתא that in a case of יכול וזה אינו יכול, all agree that he is liable. תוספות explains what is meant by יכול אינו יכול.

נראה לרבינו יצחק דהאי אינו יכול היינו אפילו בעל כח הרבה -

It is the view of the ר"י that this יכול אינו applies even to a very strong person -

אלא שהוא נושא הקורה בענין זה בכי האי גוונא שאלמלא אחר לא היה יכול לנושא לבדו -

However, currently he is carrying the beam in such a fashion that if not for the other party, he would not be able to carry it himself -

כגון באצבע או תופשה בענין זה שאינו יכול לנושא לבדו¹ -

For instance he is carrying it only with his finger, or he is grasping it in such a way that he cannot carry it by himself, so even though if he would carry it properly he would be able to carry it by himself, nevertheless since now he cannot carry it by himself, he is considered אינו יכול -

דמה לנו לכחו כיון דהשתא מיהא אינו יכול לנושא:

For what do we care about his strength, since now, however, he cannot carry it, so he is considered אינו יכול (and the יכול will be חייב).

Summary

יכול אינו יכול is determined if he can carry it in the way that he is actually carrying it.

Thinking it over

Can one argue with תוספות and say that only one who is totally incapable of carrying it is considered אינו יכול, but not one who is strong enough to carry it (even though practically now he cannot carry it)?²

¹ For instance it is a large log and he is lifting it at one end from the top which he cannot properly grasp.

² See גמרא בד"ה הי חתם סופר.