

ומודה רבי שמעון שאם ניקב בכדי טהרתו - And Rabi Shimon agrees that if it was punctured sufficiently to make it *Toh'hoir*

Overview

זירא ר' taught that ר"ש agrees that if the עציץ was punctured to the extent that it becomes טהור¹, its contents will be considered מחובר for all matters. qualifies this rule.

פירוש² כמוציא זית דסתמו³ של כלי חרס לאוכלין ושיעורן כמוציא זית⁴ -

The explanation of טהרתו בכדי is that the hole is of that size that it cannot contain an olive, for presumably an earthenware utensil is made for holding food, and their size for being טהור is if the hole is כמוציא זית -

ונראה לרבינו יצחק דהיינו טעמא דמודה משום דבטל אגב קרקע כשניקב בכדי טהרתו⁵ -

And is it the view of the ר"י that the reason ר"ש agrees that it is considered מחובר if it is טהור בכדי טהרתו, is because the עציץ is considered nullified to the ground when it is טהור בכדי טהרתו -

ודוקא⁶ בניקב כמוציא זית אבל בכלי המיוחד למשקין אף על פי שטהרתו בכונס משקה⁷ -

And טהרתו בכדי is מודה ר"ש only if the כלי חרס was ניקב כמוציא זית, however a vessel which is designated for liquids, even though that by such a vessel the rule is that it becomes טהור if the hole is sufficiently large to allow liquid to enter into the vessel, nevertheless -

לא אמרינן דבטל⁸ דאפילו לרבנן לא חשבי ליה כמחובר בכונס משקה⁹ -

We do not say in this case that ר"ש will admit that it is בטל to the קרקע and considered מחובר, for even the רבנן (who argue with ר"ש) do not consider the vessel as being מחובר (regarding זרעים) if the hole is only ככונס משקה -

¹ If a כלי is sufficiently broken (and not usable) it cannot be מקבל טומאה and if it was טמא previously, it becomes טהור.

² רש"י ד"ה בכדי וד"ה טהור וכו' זיתים.

³ An עציץ is generally made from חרס.

⁴ See the מ"מ of רבא later on this עמוד.

⁵ דתו לא הוי כלי because מחובר לקרקע is considered רש"י ד"ה בכדי.

⁶ One may assume that it is a universal rule that if this hole makes the כלי טהור, we will consider the כלי to be אגב בטל (and it will be deemed מחובר). קרקע rejects this notion

⁷ כונס משקה means that the hole is sufficiently large that if it is placed in water, the water will be able to seep inside; this hole is greater than משקה, meaning that water will seep out from this vessel. A כלי becomes טהור if it loses its utility, therefore a כלי המיוחד למשקין once it is ככונס משקה it lost its utility (for it can no longer hold liquid inside) and is טהור. See פ"ג מ"א.

⁸ Logic dictates this as well; can we say that a כלי המיוחד למשקין is nurtured from the earth to a greater degree than a כלי העשוי לאוכלין obviously their ניקה is the same. See ח"ה הר"ן.

⁹ See 'Thinking it over'.

אלא כשורש קטן¹⁰ כדאמר¹¹ בסמוך:

But rather they require the hole to be **like a small root** as the גמרא states **shortly**.

Summary

The rule that we consider it מחובר if it was טהרתו is only regarding vessels that are designated for food, but not for vessels which are designated for drink.

Thinking it over

תוספות proves that we do not say by vessels designated for drink that their content is considered מחובר if it was (בכדי טהרתו) משקה, since we see that even the רבנן require a נקב כשורש קטן (and כונס משקה is insufficient).¹² However this proof is seemingly insufficient, for perhaps the רבנן were discussing vessels designated for food (like it states later כמוציא רמון, כמוציא זית), but not vessels designated for drink; where perhaps the רבנן would agree that they consider it מחובר if טהרתו is בכדי ניקב?!¹³

¹⁰ A hole the size of a שורש קטן is larger than a hole משקה.

¹¹ The גמרא states that when the hole is כשורש קטן then it is no longer הכשר לזרעים, for it is considered מחובר.

¹² See footnote # 9.

¹³ See מהרש"א.