

Where is *Hoy'tzoh'oh* itself written

הוצאה גופה היכא כתיבא –

OVERVIEW

The גמרא asks; where is הוצאה written in the תורה. Our תוספות explains why it is necessary that הוצאה be written in the תורה.¹

anticipates a difficulty:

ואף על גב שהיתה במשכן כדאמר² הם הורידו קרשים מעגלה³ כולי -

And even though הוצאה was in the משכן, as the ברייתא stated, 'they lowered the beams from the wagon, etc.' (to the ground), so we are also prohibited from carrying from a רה"י to a רה"ר (הוצאה), so why is there a need for a פסוק –

responds:

מכל מקום אי לאו דכתיב לא הוה מחייבי עלה -

Nevertheless, if הוצאה would not be written in the תורה, one would not be liable for it -

לפי שמלאכה גרועה היא כדפירישת לעיל⁴ (דף ב,א):

Since it is an inferior מלאכה as I explained previously.

SUMMARY

We would not consider הוצאה as a מלאכה even though it was in the משכן, since it is a מלאכה גרועה.

THINKING IT OVER

If we would derive הוצאה (solely) because it was in the משכן (that 'הם הורידו וכו'), would there be a חיוב for לרה"ר, or would we say just as we do by מושיט that they only transferred the קרשים, but did not throw them, so זריקה is פטור?⁵

¹ Most of the מלאכות are not written in the תורה; we derive them from מלאכת המשכן, so why is הוצאה any different.

² לעיל מט,ב.

³ The wagons were a רה"י (they were ten טפחים high [and 'דע"ד]), the קרשים were removed from the עגלה (which was a רה"ר) and placed on the ground (which was a רה"ר). Whatever was a מלאכה in the משכן is a מלאכה on שבת.

⁴ ד"ה פשט. There תוספות explains that seemingly there is no difference whether one carried from a רה"י to a רה"י (where it is מותר), or whether one carries from a רה"י to a רה"ר (the 'work' is the same), therefore we require a פסוק to inform us that הוצאה is a מלאכה. [One cannot say that whatever took place in the משכן is a מלאכה (they walked and talked, etc.). מלאכות that are productive like planting, cooking, etc. which took place in the משכן are considered מלאכות without a פסוק, however carrying is not considered something productive, therefore we require a פסוק to render it as a מלאכה.]

⁵ See לשון הזהב בגמ' בד"ה מכדי.