

אי נמי הך דכתיבא קרי לה אב –

Alternately; this which is written is called an *Ohv*

### OVERVIEW

The גמרא offers an alternate answer why according to ר"א (who is מחייב אתולדה) some are called אבות and others תולדות; those מלאכות which are written in the תורה are called אבות, and those which are not written in the תורה are called תולדות. Our תוספות clarifies this last answer.<sup>1</sup>

הך לישנא לא איצטריך אלא משום<sup>2</sup> הוצאה:

This version was only necessary specifically for הוצאה.

### SUMMARY

Regarding (והכנסה) הוצאה, the אב is written and the תולדה is not.

### THINKING IT OVER

Does the first answer (adequately) explain why הוצאה is an אב and הכנסה is a תולדה?<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Seemingly there are many אבות which are not written in the תורה; how can the גמרא state that אבות are those מלאכות which are written in the תורה.

<sup>2</sup> This latter answer explains why הוצאה is an אב and הכנסה is a תולדה, even though they were both in the חשיבי. The reason for this difference is because הוצאה (והכנסה) is a מלאכה גרועה.

<sup>33</sup> See תוס' ד"ה ולרבי (and the previous תוספות הרא"ש).