

But perhaps they were staggered

ודילמא שלחופי הוּוּ משלחפי –

OVERVIEW

The גמרא, when attempting to show that זריקת ד"א was in the משכן, stated that the weavers of the curtains would throw the בוכיאר (the shuttle) to one another. The גמרא challenged it, saying, perhaps they sat close to each other (so there is no ד' אמות between them); to which the גמרא responded they could not be sitting close to each other for their hands would bump into each other. The גמרא asked again they still could be sitting close to each other without their hands bumping if they sat in a staggered manner. תוספות offers an alternate way to reject this suggestion .

הכי נמי הוּוּ מצי למיפרך דילמא תוך ארבע אמות¹ הוּוּ יתבי:

The גמרא could have just as well asked; ‘perhaps they were sitting within ד"א of each other’.

SUMMARY

We cannot surmise that זריקת ד"א took place in the משכן when throwing the בוכיאר, because it is possible they were sitting within ד"א of each other.

THINKING IT OVER

Could the גמרא previously, when discussing the תופרי יריעות throwing the needle to one another, have refuted the suggestion by answering משלחפי הוּוּ משלחפי² [Alternately, it would be helpful if one can distinguish between the process of תופרי יריעות, where the answer of אמות ד' is more appropriate, and the process אורגי יריעות, where the answer of משלחפי הוּוּ משלחפי is more appropriate³.]

¹ This is the same answer the גמרא gave previously regarding the תופרי יריעות. They were not that close but within ד' אמות. See ‘Thinking it over’.

² See אברהם.

³ Perhaps when pulling the בוכיאר with the ערב thread, one needs more than ד' אמות of free space on his side.