

## By rotted straw

## בתיבנא<sup>1</sup> סריא -

### Overview

The גמרא explained the משנה which stated that straw can be הוצץ (even though usually he will need the straw to feed it to his cattle), is because we are discussing straw which has rotted away and is unsuitable to be used as cattle feed. תוספות at first challenges, and then explains this assumption

תוספות asks:

תימה אכתי חזיא לבהמתו על ידי פירוך כדמוכח בפרק בתרא דשבת (דף קנה,ב) דאמרין<sup>2</sup> -

**It is astounding!** for even though the straw is rotten, nevertheless **it is still fit for his cattle by crushing it**, as is evident in the last פרק of שבת מסכת, where the גמרא states -

תא שמע מפרכין את התבן כולי אלמא מיטרח באוכלא שרי<sup>3</sup> ומשני בתיבנא סריא<sup>4</sup> -  
'come and hear; "we crush the straw, etc."; so it is apparent that it is permitted to toil in regards to food, and the גמרא answers, it is with rotted straw' –

תוספות answers:

ויש לומר דהכא מיירי שהוא מוסרח כל כך דאפילו על ידי שום תקון לא חזיא:

**And one can say; that here it is a case where it is so rotten that even going through any process of fixing, it will still not be fit** for consumption.

### Summary

Crushing rotten straw may make it fit if it is not extremely rotten.

### Thinking it over

If the תבן in מסכת שבת is not as rotten as the תבן here; how come the גמרא calls them both סריא (תיבנא)?!<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup> In our גמרות the text reads בסריא (not בתיבנא סריא).

<sup>2</sup> Previously, on the עמוד א' there, יהודה ר' maintains than one may make unfit food, fit for his cattle, but he may not improve on food which is already fit for his cattle.

<sup>3</sup> Straw is proper feed and nevertheless the ברייתא allows one to crush it and improve it, this (seemingly) contradicts the view of ר"י (see footnote # 2).

<sup>4</sup> Rotten straw is not fit to be used as feed unless it is crushed. We see that even rotted straw is fit for feed if it is crushed, so how can the גמרא say here that the תבנא סריא is not fit for feed, when, if it is crushed, it is fit for feed. So we should be concerned perhaps he will remove it, crush it, and feed it to his animals.

<sup>5</sup> בסריא is גירסא the here, however בתיבנא סריא is שבת in גירסא the להעיר<sup>5</sup> (see footnote # 1).