

I punished him

— **אנא ענישתיה** —

OVERVIEW

The אמוראים relates that when רב אדא בר אבא passed on, each one of the various אמוראים stated that ר"א died because, 'I punished him'. תוספות has a novel view on this story.

כל אחד מהן היה מתאונן שעל ידו מת רב אדא -

Each one of them (who stated 'אנא ענישתיה') was bemoaning that fact that ר"א died because of him; the reason they bemoaned it, is -

משום דאמרין בשבת בפרק שואל (דף קמ"ט,ב) כל מי שחבירו נענש על ידו -

For ר' יעקב said in פרק שואל in מסכת שבת, 'whoever causes that his friend is punished on his account -

אין מכניסין אותו במחיצתו של הקדוש ברוך הוא -

We do not let him enter into the partition where 'הקב"ה is found', and we derive it -

שנאמר (משלי יז) גם ענוש לצדיק לא טוב אלא רע וכתוב (תהלים ה') לא יגורך רע³. רבינו יצחק:

For it is written, 'it is also not good for the righteous to punish' meaning that it is rather evil, and it is also written, 'evil shall not dwell by You'. This was said by the ר"י.

SUMMARY

They were bemoaning [the possibility of] causing the death of ר"א, thereby denying themselves to be במחיצתו של הקב"ה.

THINKING IT OVER

The simple reading of the text (for instance אנא ענישתיה דאפסיד גרוגרות דידי indicates that they were not bemoaning, just stating that ה' took up their cause, and therefore ר"א was punished;⁴ why did תוספות find it necessary to interpret it as bemoaning?!

¹ פסוק כו.

² פסוק ה'.

³ The צדיק who causes punishment did not do something good, but rather something evil, and evil cannot dwell with הקב"ה, so therefore all these אמוראים bemoaned the fact that they may have caused the death of ר"א.

⁴ According to תוס' פ"י הוס' they each should have said 'על ידי מת', why אנא ענישתיה!