

Where they were reclining

שהיו מסובין –

Overview

The ברייתא relates the incident where ר' יהודה and רשב"ג, ר' יוסי were eating ע"ש and קדש עליהם היום. Our תוספות explains when they began to eat.

והתחילו בהיתר¹ שהרי רבי יהודה היה² שם.

And they were permitted to begin, since ר"י was there and ate with them.

הכי גרסינן בתוספתא³ אמר לו אם כן לא נפסיק –

This is how the text reads in the תוספתא; ‘he said to him “if indeed it is so, we should not interrupt”’ -

והכי פירושו⁴ אם כן כיון שמחית לא נפסיק שמא יראו התלמידים:

And this is its explanation; if indeed it is so, since you protested, we should not interrupt, for perhaps the students will see, and will establish this law (of הפסקה) for posterity.

Summary

We know that they began בהיתר, since ר' יהודה was with them.

Thinking it over

Is it necessary to say the ר' יהודה was actually eating with them, or we can derive that from the fact the ר' יהודה was present, even though he may not have joined them in the meal?

¹ התחילו may be reiterating what he stated previously אין בד"ה that when ר' יהודה rules מפסיקין that is even if בהיתר.

² ר' יהודה maintains that one is not permitted to begin eating on ע"ש מן המנחה ולמעלה, and since ר' יהודה was together with them, it must be that they began earlier היתר. See ‘Thinking it over’.

³ (א"ל א"כ לא נפסיק) גמרא in our גורס that תוספות was not ברכות פ"ה ה"ב.

⁴ Initially רשב"ג said to יוסף, ‘perhaps we should be מפסיק on account of our colleague ר' יהודה’. When ר' יוסי protested, ר' יהודה disagreed with ר' יוסי, what did רשב"ג mean with the א"כ, he knew all along that ר' יוסי disagreed with ר' יהודה. The explanation is, if ר' יוסי would not have protested and they would be מפסיק, there is no concern שמא יראו התלמידים וכו', since they would understand that the reason they were מפסיק is out of deference to ר' יהודה, it was merely חומרא, but not that this is the הלכה. However once ר' יוסי protested and did not want to be מפסיק, if they would be מפסיק that would prove that the הלכה is like ר' יהודה, therefore רשב"ג said וכו' שמא יראו התלמידים וכו'.